

معجم الاحاديث المعتبرة

**A Comprehensive  
Compilation of Reliable  
Narrations**

Compiled by:

Ayatullah Muhammad Asif al-Muhsini (الكندھاري)

Translated by:

Ammar Muslim Hussein (الدودي)

Copyright © 2017 by Ammaar M. Hussein

All rights reserved. This electronic document or any portion thereof may not be reproduced or used in any manner whatsoever without the express written permission of the translator except for the use of brief quotations in a book review.

First Published Online, Oct. 2017

To Contact the Translator

Ammaar Muslim (C/O Muslim Bhanji)

Dar-ul-Muslimeen Education Center

P.O. Box 2736

Dodoma

Tanzania

E-mail: [ammaar.muslim.hussein@gmail.com](mailto:ammaar.muslim.hussein@gmail.com)

## Preface

### بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ نَحْمَدُهُ وَنَسْتَعِينُهُ وَنَسْتَغْفِرُهُ وَنَسْتَهْدِيهِ وَنَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ شُرُورِ أَنْفُسِنَا وَمِنْ سَيِّئَاتِ  
أَعْمَالِنَا مَنْ يَهْدِيَ اللَّهُ فَلَا مُضِلَّ لَهُ وَ مَنْ يَضِلَّ فَلَا هَادِيَ لَهُ وَ أَشْهَدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَحْدَهُ لَا  
شَرِيكَ لَهُ وَ أَشْهَدُ أَنَّ مُحَمَّدًا عَبْدُهُ وَ رَسُولُهُ اِنْتَجَبَهُ لَوْلَايَتِهِ وَ اخْتَصَّهُ بِرِسَالَتِهِ وَ أَكْرَمَهُ بِالنُّبُوَّةِ أَمِينًا  
عَلَى غَيْبِهِ وَ رَحْمَةً لِّلْعَالَمِينَ وَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ

All praise belongs to Allah, we praise Him, seek His aid, ask his forgiveness, make Him our guide, and we seek refuge in Allah from the evil inclinations of our own selves and the evil consequences of our acts. Whomever is guided by Allah then there is none to misguide him, and whoever He misguides then there is no guide for him. I bear witness that there is no god but Allah, alone, having no partner, and I bear witness that Muhammad is his slave and messenger, He chose him for His guardianship, singled him out with His message, and honoured him with prophethood. He was the trustee over His unseen and a mercy for all creatures. May Allah send benediction upon Muhammad and His family<sup>1</sup>

has been attributed to al-Sadiq:

العامل على غير بصيرة كالسائر على غير الطريق لا يزيده سرعة السير إلا بعدا

The one who acts without insight is like the one who walks on a wrong path, speeding up does nothing but make him more distant [from where he is supposed to be]<sup>2</sup>

This insight can only be provided in the Hadith of the Prophet and his righteous successors which is the light by which religion is illuminated. It is because of understanding this that scholars throughout the ages have expended commensurable efforts to collect, authenticate and explain their words.

Unfortunately, most of these works are in Arabic. English-speaking audience have faced challenges at times to access such primary sources. It is hoped that this work will contribute towards the aim of bringing readers closer to the treasure trove.

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 3/422, in a Sahih narration on the authority of Muhammad b. Muslim from Abi Ja'far al-Baqir about what the introduction of a speaker should be

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/43

## Introduction

Shaykh Muhammad Asif al-Muhsini had always wanted to collect the narrations that are Mu'tabar [reliable] as far as their chains are concerned. The aim is to assist the jurist in his derivation process, the researcher in conducting studies, the popular lecturer in preparing speeches, but even ordinary layman who are interested in knowledge.

The result of his efforts was the publishing of the multi-volume book "Mu'jam al-Ahadith al-Mu'tabara" which can roughly be translated as 'A Comprehensive Compilation of Reliable Narrations' in 8 volumes [1434 AH / 2012 AD] containing around 11523 unique reports.

There are several important points to keep in mind about al-Muhsini's methodology in the book:

1. In general, a report is acceptable if it fulfills the following conditions:

[a] Reliability of the chain; such that it is connected and its narrators are truthful people. Or there be an internal or external (to the Hadith itself) Qarina (indicator) that leads to Itmi'nan (personal confidence) with regards to the Hadith's authenticity

[b] Should not contradict the intellect and basic common sense

[c] Should not contradict the Qur'an

[d] Should not contradict the established Sunnah (Normative model of the prophet)

[e] Should not be conflict other stronger narrations

2. A Hadith with weak chain will not be included except very rarely when it serves a purpose, in which case this will be pointed out. The main aim is to include the narrations reliable by their chains, those that are termed Sahih, Hasan, Muwathaq and Qawi. If a report with a strong-chain is conflicting with the Qur'an or the intellect he promises to point this out and discuss it, and if it is contrary to a verified Sunnah or has other contradictory narrations to contend against, then detailed elaboration and resolution is left to the study of Fiqh.

3. The book is not all-comprehensive, in the sense that all the narrations with reliable chains are found in it, rather a researcher might find quite a number of narrations which he has overlooked because of human fallibility. However, the overwhelming majority of reliable narrations should be found in the book.

4. The claim is not being made that every narration which does not have a reliable chain is fabricated, for it may happen that an unknown narrator was in fact truthful, similarly, a liar does not always lie, so the chain not being reliable and the narration being false are not necessarily the same thing. Furthermore, al-Muhsini states that he does not claim that every narration that is reliable in its chain actually originates from the Ma'sum in reality, for a generally truthful person might lie sometimes without being caught, and the trustworthy might betray, and all narrators however careful can make mistakes borne out of lapses in memory. Despite this, a reliable-chain has Hujjiyya [probative force], a purely logical construct making it sufficient in the Law. We will be justified [not blamable] for acting on it. It is not allowed to turn away from it without having a superior proof.

5. It is quite probable that a lot of narrations with weak chains do actually go back to the 'Aimma and originate from them. Moreover, there is a lot of wisdom and ethical maxims to be found in such narrations which can be beneficial, thus, this project should not be taken to mean that reports with weak chains are worthless or need to be expunged from our corpus. All it seeks to do is apply the imperfect tool of Ilm al-Rijal [science of the evaluation of narrators] to compile a baseline of reliable-in-chain narrations. At the very least, someone who does not accept the role of Ilm al-Rijal in categorizing narrations should be contented that a large number of the narrations of the 'Aimma are being made accessible to a wider audience.

6. All that is in the book (apart from the exception noted above i.e. including some weak in chain narrations together with a disclaimer) is reliable in its chain, and it is permissible to attribute them to the 'Aimma. On the other hand, al-Muhsini believes that it is not allowed to attribute weak-in-chain narrations to them such that someone says "al-Sadiq said such and such ..." as is common among speakers and lecturers.

7. As has been pointed out previously, a weak-in-chain report can still gain Hujjiyya if it leads to Itmi'nan, for this there needs to be Qarain coupled with it such as plurality of chains, or the 'criteria of embarresment' e.g. the Sunnis reporting the highest Fadhal of Ali which they would not have any motive for, in fact it causes them problems, despite this they were too strong to ignore. However, it is a painstaking task to collect and evaluate diverse indicators for each such narration, and al-Muhsini clarifies that he has not engaged in such an endeavour despite it being beneficial, except in a few isolated cases. Again it is stressed that the primary aim of the project was to include reliable-in-chain narrations and not all narrations that can be judged reliable [via the non-chain route].

8. Someone might ask the question: The judgment of al-Muhsini in regards a narration has no value to someone else apart from him (especially those who can formulate their own opinions and make Ijtihad). This is because the principles involved in strengthening or weakening narrators as found in *Ilm al-Rijal* are subjective and not definitive and people have differed over them. If this be the case, what was the use of al-Muhsini in expending effort in authoring this book?

In fact, as al-Muhsini makes clear, he is someone who has stringent views which he applies rigorously i.e. very strict criteria for accepting narrations. It is therefore thought that what he considers to be reliable and includes in the book would be unobjectionable to most other scholars, except in some rare instances where a scholar might have a dissenting view.

On the other hand, what al-Muhsini leaves out from the book is not weakened unanimously, rather it might happen that a majority of the scholars consider it reliable because of the prevalent lax standards. However, since it is preferable in such matters to rule on the side of caution, the utility of the book becomes clear since it provides a common core of narrations that are irreproachable.

9. There is a lack of information about the transmission history of a considerable number of primary Hadith works. The manuscripts of such works did not reach scholars like al-Majlisi and Hurr - who incorporated them in their encyclopedic compilations - via an acceptable method. Rather, the authors of *Bihar al-Anwar*, *Wasail al-Shia* and *al-Wafi* happened upon them from the market and various libraries. We are still in the dark about how exactly they were passed down over the hundreds of years in the intervening period between when they were authored and the Safavid era in which they were discovered. It is because of this that al-Muhsini is discriminating about the books he considers as potential sources for mining reliable narrations.

In other words, if a book's transmission history is suspect in his eyes he will not investigate the Hadith it contains any further [even if they have reliable chains to the author of the book]. This I feel is one of the weaknesses of the project as a large number of narrations from sources like *Mahasin* of al-Barqi, *Basair al-Darajat*, *Amali al-Mufid*, *Amali al-Tusi*, *al-Ikhtisas* etc. are ignored.

It is hoped that serious studies are conducting about these manuscripts many of which are just laying gathering dust in various libraries to answer questions about their authorship and attribution beyond suspicion. If someone is also able to add to this Mu'ajm narrations from these sources [perhaps with a disclaimer] then it would be beneficial as al-Muhsini's rejection of them seems a bit flippant.

10. A note on the convention followed in numbering.

When one encounters: [A/B]

The number on the left (A) is the number of the narration in that particular chapter, while the number on the right (B) is the number of the narration overall, across all the chapters and volumes.

Sometimes one can encounter something like this: [A/-]

The number on the left (A) continues to be the number of the narration in that chapter, while there is no number on the right which has been replaced with a dash. This signifies either one of two things:

[a] al-Muhsini is not entirely sure of the narration's authenticity because there exists some doubt about one or more narrators. This will be pointed out in the footnote.

[b] The narration has already come before or will come again in future chapters i.e. repetition, thus, a number is not given to avoid numbering the same narration more than once.

I have taken the liberty to excise the method of transmission in the chain such as 'qara'tu', 'sami'tu' etc. and replaced it with *عن* in Arabic, and a – in the english chain. This is not to say that these do not have any significance, rather the researcher will know how important they are and where to find them.

Finally, the references in the footnotes are in the format Volume No. / Page Number

كتاب العقل والعلم

**Book of Intellect and  
Knowledge**



## Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Subservience of Intellect and its Excellence .....	1
Chapter 2: Sign of Perfection of Intellect.....	3
Chapter 3: Merit of Knowledge and the Scholar; The Obligation of Knowledge .....	4
Chapter 4: Reward of the Scholar and the Seeker of Knowledge .....	7
Chapter 5: Attributes of the Scholar.....	9
Chapter 6: Asking the Scholar and Discussing with Him.....	11
Chapter 7: Prohibition on Speaking without Knowledge and Ruling based on Opinion .....	13
Chapter 8: Accountability of the Scholar and its Severity .....	16
Chapter 9: Miscellaneous .....	17
Chapter 10: Transmitting the Narration Non-Verbatim .....	19
Chapter 11: Prohibition of Blind Following .....	20
Chapter 12: Regarding Innovation and Analogical Reasoning .....	20
Chapter 13: Ruling of Everything is in the Book and the Sunna .....	25
Chapter 15: Some Reasons for Differences between Narrations.....	29
Chapter 16: Fitting Response Relative to the Understanding of the Questioner .....	32
Chapter 17: No Excuse for the Ignorant One who Falls Short.....	34
Chapter 18: Narration that Contradicts the Qur'an .....	34

## Preamble

The first book of the first volume is the book of Intellect and Knowledge. Some short words on the Islamic conception of both is in order.

Aql is the vehicle through which the initial queries about the reality of life and nature of the world is made. It is also essential component towards the Ma'rifa [recognition] of Allah. Thus it becomes the preliminary 'inner prophet' which can lead to 'outward' guidance and consequently obedience of Allah. It has been attributed to al-Sadiq that he said when asked to define Aql:

ما عبد به الرحمن واكتسب به الجنان

That by which the Rahman [Most Merciful] is worshipped and by which the Gardens are acquired<sup>1</sup>

Aql is what will be held accountable. The more perfect the Aql of the one doing the deed the more complete it becomes and vice versa. The messenger of Allah is supposed to have said:

إذا رأيتم الرجل كثير الصلاة كثير الصيام فلا تباهوا به حتى تنظروا كيف عقله؟

If you see a man who prays a lot and fasts a lot then do not be overly impressed with him until you observe how his Aql is<sup>2</sup>

Knowledge and its pursuit has been given such importance in Islam that a Western Scholar like Rosenthal could speak of the 'Empire of Reason'. Knowledge is of many types, but the one which has been obligated is acquiring the knowledge which will make one succeed in this world and hereafter i.e. knowledge of the creator and one's obligations towards Him.

It is not enough to gain knowledge in theoretical terms, in fact the very definition of knowledge is the one which is put into practise. This is best summed up in a narration attributed to the Commander of the Faithful:

حسبك من العلم أن تخشى الله، وحسبك من الجهل أن تعجب بعلمك

It is enough to be considered knowledge that you be in awe of Allah, and it is enough to be considered ignorance that you feel proud with that which you know<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/11

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/26

<sup>3</sup> Amali of al-Tusi: 1/62

## الباب الأول: انقياد العقل وشرفه

### Chapter 1: Subservience of Intellect and its Excellence

[1/1] الكافي: عدة من أصحابنا منهم محمد بن يحيى العطار، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن الحسن بن محبوب، عن العلاء بن رزين، عن محمد بن مسلم، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: لما خلق الله العقل استنطقه ثم قال له: أقبل فأقبل ثم قال له: أدبر فأدبر ثم قال: وعزتي وجلالي ما خلقت خلقا هو أحب إلي منك ولا أكملتك إلا فيمن أحب، أما إني إياك أمر وإياك أنهي، وإياك أعاقب وإياك أثيب

[1/1] al-Kafi: *A number of our companions among them Muhammad b. Yahya al-Attar – Ahmad b. Muhammad – al-Hasan b. Mahbub – al-Ala b. Razin – Muhammad b. Muslim from Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام *who said: «When Allah created the intellect<sup>1</sup> He gave it the power to speak, then He said to it: draw near, so it drew near, then He said to it: turn back, so it turned back, then He said to it: by my Might and Majesty I have not created a creature more beloved to me than you, and I will not perfect you except in the one I love. You do I command, and you do I prohibit. You do I punish and you do I reward»<sup>2</sup>*

[2/2] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن ابن فضال، عن الحسن بن الجهم قال: سمعت الرضا عليه السلام يقول: صديق كل امرء عقله، وعدوه جهله

[2/2] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Ibn Fadhal – al-Hasan b. al-Jahm* *who said: I heard al-Ridha* عليه السلام *saying: «The friend of every man is his intellect, and his enemy is his ignorance»<sup>3</sup>*

[3/3] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن فضال، عن الحسن بن الجهم قال: قلت لابي الحسن عليه السلام: إن عندنا قوما لهم محبة وليست لهم تلك العزيمة يقولون بهذا القول. فقال: ليس اولئك ممن عاتب الله إنما قال الله: فَأَعْتَبُوا يَا أُولِي الْأَبْصَارِ

[3/3] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad – Ibn Fadhal – al-Hasan b. al-Jahm* *who said: I said to Abi al-Hasan* عليه السلام *: We have a group who have love [towards you] but they do not have that firm a resolve<sup>4</sup> although they profess this belief [Tashayyu]. He* عليه السلام

<sup>1</sup> There is no perfect translation for this word in English. The narrations that speak of Aql, notwithstanding the ones with a mystical bent which treat it as a 'being' in some cosmological sense, all indicate that it is above mere intellect in the sense of cleverness. They expect every possessor of Aql to follow the way of Allah (i.e. Islam) which is the logical thing to do i.e. the one who disobeys Allah does not have Aql. Perhaps a better word would be 'consciousness' with its evocation of self-awareness of who we are and what Allah wants from us.

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/10; It has also been narrated by al-Saduq with a reliable chain [of al-Saduq: 503 No. 5]

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/11; It has also been narrated by al-Saduq with two different reliable chains [See: Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha: 2/27 and Ilal al-Shara`i: 1/101]

<sup>4</sup> Their love does not translate into action

said: «These are not those who were admonished by Allah when Allah said: “So give heed O possessors of insight”<sup>1</sup>»<sup>2</sup>

[٤/٤] رجال الكشي: حمدويه بن نصير، عن أيوب بن نوح، عن صفوان بن يحيى، عن داود بن فرقد قال: سمعت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام يقول: إن أصحابي أولو النهى و التتى، فمن لم يكن من أهل النهى و التتى فليس من أصحاب

[4/4] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh b. Nusayr – Ayyub b. Nuh – Safwan b. Yahya – Dawud b. Farqad who said*: I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «My companions are the people of discernment and God-consciousness, whoever is not from the people of discernment and God-consciousness then he is not from my companions»<sup>3</sup>

[٥/٥] الكافي: علي، عن أبيه، عن أبي هاشم الجعفري قال: كنا عند الرضا عليه السلام فتذاكرنا العقل والادب فقال: يا أبا هاشم العقل حياء من الله والادب كلفة، فمن تكلف الادب قدر عليه، ومن تكلف العقل لم يزد بذلك إلا جهلا

[5/5] al-Kafi: *Ali – his father – Abi Hashim al-Ja'fari who said*: We were with al-Ridha عليه السلام when we began discussing intellect and moral virtue, so he said: «O Abu Hashim, intellect is a free gift from Allah while virtue is an effortful acquisition<sup>4</sup>, whoever strives to acquire virtue is able to possess it, but whoever strives to acquire intellect he achieves naught by that except further ignorance»<sup>5</sup>

[٦/٦] الكافي: أبو عبد الله العاصمي، عن علي بن الحسن، عن علي بن أسباط، عن الحسن ابن الجهم، عن أبي الحسن الرضا عليه السلام قال: ذكر عنده أصحابنا وذكر العقل قال: فقال عليه السلام: لا يعبا بأهل الدين ممن لا عقل له، قلت: جعلت فداك إن ممن يصف هذا الامر قوما لا بأس بهم عندنا وليست لهم تلك العقول فقال: ليس هؤلاء ممن خاطب الله إن الله خلق العقل فقال له: اقبل فاقبل، وقال له: أدبر فأدبر، فقال: وعزتي وجلالي ما خلقت شيئا أحسن منك أو احب إلي منك، بك آخذ وبك اعطي

[6/6] al-Kafi: *Abu Abdillah al-Asimi – Ali b. al-Hasan – Ali b. Asbat – al-Hasan b. al-Jahm – Abi al-Hasan al-Ridha* عليه السلام. *He [al-Asimi] said*: Our companions [the Shia] and intellect were mentioned in his presence, so he عليه السلام said: «No consideration is given to a follower of the religion who has no intellect» I [al-Asimi] said: May I be made your ransom, from those who profess this affair [Wilaya] are some whom we consider to be well-meaning but they do not possess that level of intellect. He said: «Such people are not the ones addressed by Allah, verily Allah created the intellect and said to it: draw near, so it drew near, and said to it: turn back, so it turned back, then He said: by my Might and Majesty I have not created a thing better than you [or more beloved to me than you], by you do I take and by you do I give»<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Qur'an 59:2. Their religion is not based on intellectual grounds thus it is just an emotional attachment

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/11

<sup>3</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 255 No. 473

<sup>4</sup> There are geniuses who do not recognize God but try to live moral lives. Their Aql has not been perfected

<sup>5</sup> al-Kafi: 1/23-24

<sup>6</sup> al-Kafi: 1/27-28. It is as though this is more complete version of the report [3/3] above

## الباب الثاني: علامة كمال العقل

### Chapter 2: Sign of Perfection of Intellect

[١/٧] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن محبوب، عن عبد الله بن سنان قال: ذكرت لابي عبد الله عليه السلام رجلا مبتلى بالوضوء والصلاة وقلت: هو رجل عاقل فقال أبو عبد الله عليه السلام: وأي عقل له وهو يطيع الشيطان؟ فقلت له: وكيف يطيع الشيطان؟ فقال سله هذا الذي يأتيه من أي شيء هو؟ فإنه يقول لك من عمل الشيطان

[1/7] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad – Ibn Mahbub – Abdallah b. Sinan who said*: I mentioned a person who was afflicted by forgetfulness in Wudhu and Salat to Abu Abdillah عليه السلام and added: He is a person with intellect. Abu Abdillah عليه السلام said: «What kind of intellect does he have while he is obeying Satan?» I said to him: How is he obeying Satan? he said: «Ask him - this that comes over him - what is its cause? he will tell you it is from the handiwork of Satan»<sup>1</sup>

[٢/٨] الخصال: أبيه، عن سعد بن عبد الله، عن أحمد أبي عبد الله البرقي، عن الحسن بن علي بن فضال، عن ثعلبة بن ميمون، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: قال أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام: الرجال ثلاثة: عاقل وأحمق وفاجر، فالعاقل الدين شريعته، والحلم طبيعته، والرأي سجيته، إن سئل أجاب، وإن تكلم أصاب، وإن سمع وعى، وإن حدث صدق، وإن اطمان إليه أحد وفي، والاحمق إن استنبه بجميل غفل، وإن استنزل عن حسن نزل، وإن حمل على جهل جهل، وإن حدث كذب، لا يفقه وإن فقه لا يتفقه، والفاجر إن ائتمنته خانك، وإن صاحبتة شانك وإن وثقت به لم ينصحك

[2/8] al-Khisal: *His father – Sa'd b. Abdallah – Ahmad b. Abi Abdallah al-Barqi – al-Hasan b. Ali b. Fadhal – Tha'laba b. Maymun – Abi Abdillah عليه السلام who said*: «The Commander of the Faithful عليه السلام said: Men are of three kinds: intelligent, foolish and corrupt sinner. As for the intelligent one the religion is his path, and forbearance is his habit, and giving counsel is his disposition, when he is asked he answers, and when he speaks he is to the point, and when he hears he comprehends, and when he reports he is truthful, and when one confides in him he is loyal. As for the fool if someone alerts him to a beautiful thing he overlooks it, and if he is dissuaded from good he acquiesces to forsake it, and if he is driven to ignorance he becomes ignorant, and if he reports he is incorrect, he does not understand and if perchance he is able to understand he does not learn from it. As for the corrupt sinner if you rely on him he betrays you, and if you befriend him he hates you, and if you trust him he is not sincere with you»<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/12

<sup>2</sup> al-Khisal: 1/116

## الباب الثالث: فضل العلم والعالم وفرض العلم

### Chapter 3: Merit of Knowledge and the Scholar; The Obligation of Knowledge

[١/٩] الخصال: أبيه، عن علي، عن أبيه، عن ابن ميمون، عن جعفر بن محمد عليهما السلام، عن آباءه عليهم السلام، عن علي عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: فضل العلم أحب إلى الله من فضل العبادة وأفضل دينكم الورع

[1/9] al-Khisal: *His father – Ali – his father – Ibn Maymun – Ja 'far b. Muhammad* عليهم السلام – *his forefathers* عليهم السلام – *Ali* عليه السلام *who said*: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: The merit of knowledge is more beloved to Allah than the merit of worship. The best of your religion is self-restraint [from sins]»<sup>1</sup>

[٢/١٠] الكافي: علي، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن سيف بن عميرة، عن أبي حمزة، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: عالم ينتفع بعلمه أفضل من سبعين ألف عابد

[2/10] al-Kafi: *Ali – his father – Ibn Abi Umayr<sup>2</sup> – Sayf b. Umayra – Abi Hamza – Abi Ja 'far* عليه السلام *who said*: «The scholar whose knowledge benefits others<sup>3</sup> is better than seventy thousand worshippers»<sup>4</sup>

[٣/١١] الكافي: علي، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن جميل، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: سمعته يقول: يغدو الناس على ثلاثة أصناف عالم ومتعلم وغثاء فنحن العلماء وشيعتنا المتعلمون وسائر الناس غثاء

[3/11] al-Kafi: *Ali – Muhammad b. Isa – Yunus – Jamil – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام. *He [Jamil] said*: I heard him saying: «The people rise up [every morning] being in one of three categories: Knowledgeable scholar, student seeking knowledge or scum. So we [the 'Aimma] are the scholars and our Shia are the students and the rest of the people are scum»<sup>5</sup>

[٤/١٢] الخصال: عن ابن الوليد، عن الصفار، عن ابن عيسى، عن الوشاء، عن احمد بن عائد، عن ابي خديجة، عن ابي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: الناس يغدون على ثلاثة (ثم ذكر مثله) ...

<sup>1</sup> al-Khisal: 1/166

<sup>2</sup> al-Kulayni narrates the same report with an alternative strand to Ibn Abi Umayr which is: Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad

<sup>3</sup> The Arabic can also be read as “the scholar who benefits from [makes use] of his knowledge ...”

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/33

<sup>5</sup> al-Kafi: 1/34

[4/12] al-Khisal: *Ibn al-Walid – al-Saffar – Ibn Isa – al-Washsha – Ahmad b. A'idh – Abi Khadija – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «The people rise up [every morning] being in one of three categories [then he mentioned its like] ...»<sup>1</sup>

[٥/١٣] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد، عن ابن محبوب، عن أبي أيوب الخزاز، عن سليمان بن خالد، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: ما من أحد يموت من المؤمنين أحب إلى إبليس من موت فقيه

[5/13] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad – Ibn Mahbub – Abi Ayyub al-Khazzaz – Sulayman b. Khalid – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «No one dies from among the believers whose death is more pleasing to the Devil than the death of a Faqih»<sup>2 3</sup>

[٦/١٤] الخصال: ابن الوليد، عن الصفار، عن ابن عيسى، عن ابن محبوب، عن عبد الله بن سنان قال: سمعت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام يقول: إني لأرحم ثلاثة وحق لهم أن يرحموا: عزيز أصابته مذلة بعد العز، وغني أصابته حاجة بعد الغنى، وعالم يستخف به أهله والجهلة

[6/14] al-Khisal: *Ibn al-Walid – al-Saffar – Ibn Isa – Ibn Mahbub – Abdallah b. Sinan* *who said:* I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «I have mercy on three and they do indeed deserve mercy: a man of standing who has been stricken with lowliness after his former high position, a man of riches who has been stricken with need after his former self-sufficiency, and a scholar who is belittled by his family and the ignorant»<sup>4</sup>

[٧/١٥] الكافي: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: طلب العلم فريضة على كل مسلم

[7/15] al-Kafi: *The messenger of Allah* صلى الله عليه وآله *said:* «Seeking knowledge is compulsory on every Muslim»<sup>5 6</sup>

[٨/١٦] الخصال: أبي، عن سعد، عن البرقي، عن أبيه، عن صفوان، عن الخزاز، عن محمد بن مسلم وغيره، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: اغد علما أو متعلما أو أحب العلماء ولا تكن رابعا فتهلك ببغضهم

[8/16] al-Khisal: *My father – Sa'd – al-Barqi – his father*<sup>7</sup> – *Safwan – al-Khazzaz – Muhammad b. Muslim and other than him – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «The messenger of Allah صلى

<sup>1</sup> al-Khisal: 1/123

<sup>2</sup> A Faqih is a scholar who has a deep understanding of the religion puts it into practice

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/38

<sup>4</sup> It has also been narrated by al-Saduq with two different reliable chains [See: al-Khisal: 1/86 and al-Amali of al-Saduq: 62 No. 8]

<sup>5</sup> The masculine “Muslim” here subsumes the female as is also found in Qur’anic usage

<sup>6</sup> al-Kafi: 1/30. Even though there is no single reliable chain for this narration in our books - the large number of corroborating chains leads to Wuthuq [confidence] about its authenticity [See: Bihar al-Anwar 1/171 and the pages that follow]

<sup>7</sup> al-Muhsini does not consider Ahmad’s father [Muhammad b. Khalid al-Barqi] to be Thiqa, he only accepts his narrations by way of precaution

الله عليه وآله said: Rise up [every morning] either as a scholar<sup>1</sup> or a student seeking knowledge or loving the scholars, and do not be a fourth for you will perish because of your hatred of them [the scholars]»<sup>2</sup>

[9/17] الكافي: محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن جميل بن دراج، عن أبان بن تغلب، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: لوددت أن أصحابي ضربت رؤوسهم بالسياط حتى يتفقهوا

[9/17] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Ismail<sup>3</sup> – al-Fadhl b. Shadhan – Ibn Abi Umayr – Jamil b. Salih – Aban b. Taghlib – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «I am even willing that my companions' heads be lashed with whips [if that is what it takes] for them to gain a comprehensive understanding [of the religion]»<sup>4</sup>

الخصال: في حديث الأربعائة: قال أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام: علموا صبيانكم ما ينفعهم به، لا يغلب عليهم المرجئة برأيا

[10/-] al-Khisal: In the 'Four Hundred' Narration<sup>5</sup>: *The Commander of the Faithful* عليه السلام *said:* «Teach your children that which will benefit them - the Murjia should not overpower them with their speculative opinions<sup>6 7</sup>»

---

<sup>1</sup> The "scholar" referred to here is any learned person as opposed to [3/11] and [4/12] wherein it referred specifically to the infallible

<sup>2</sup> al-Khisal: 1/123

<sup>3</sup> Muhammad b. Ismail the Shaykh of al-Kulayni is unknown. But this does not affect the reliability of the chain for he is merely a Shaykh of Ijaza who licensed al-Kulayni to make use of the works of al-Fadhl b. Shadhan. al-Kulayni used him merely to avoid using a Wijada copy which would entail disconnection. Moreover, there is not much of a time gap between al-Kulayni and al-Fadhl who was a major scholar with popular works, it is not expected that any alterations to the copy that al-Kulayni uses of al-Fadhl's works made by Muhammad b. Ismail would have gone undetected.

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/31

<sup>5</sup> The 'Four Hundred Narration' is a long report containing four hundred sayings from the Commander of the Faithful. Initially al-Muhsini had considered its chain to be unreliable because of the presence of al-Qasim b. Yahya and his grandfather al-Hasan b. Rashid. However, he later changed his opinion about them based on what he found in al-Faqih of al-Saduq [See Buhuth fi Ilm al-Rijal for detail]

<sup>6</sup> If the Shia youth do not know their religion then it is very easy for them to become convinced by the seemingly strong arguments of the Murjia [an early school of thought within Islam].

<sup>7</sup> al-Khisal: 2/614



## الباب الرابع: ثواب العالم والمتعلم

### Chapter 4: Reward of the Scholar and the Seeker of Knowledge

[1/18] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن القداح، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: من سلك طريقاً يطلب فيه علماً سلك الله به طريقاً إلى الجنة وإن الملائكة لتضع أجنحتها لطالب العلم رضا به وإنه يستغفر لطالب العلم من في السماء ومن في الأرض حتى الحوت في البحر، وفضل العالم على العابد كفضل القمر على سائر النجوم ليلة البدر، وإن العلماء ورثة الأنبياء إن الأنبياء لم يورثوا ديناراً ولا درهماً ولكن ورثوا العلم فمن أخذ منه أخذ بحظ وافر

[1/18] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father – Hammad b. Isa – al-Qaddah<sup>1</sup> – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said*: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: Whoever treads a path seeking knowledge Allah makes him tread a path to paradise. The angels lay down their wings for the seeker of knowledge being pleased with him. They do seek forgiveness for the seeker of knowledge whatsoever is in heaven and whatsoever is on earth even the fish in the sea. The merit of the scholar over the worshipper is like the excellence of the moon over the rest of the stars on a full-moon night. The scholars are the inheritors of the prophets, the prophets do not leave behind silver or gold coins rather they leave behind knowledge so whomsoever partakes of it then he has obtained an abundant share»<sup>2</sup>

[2/19] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن الحسن بن محبوب، عن جميل بن صالح عن محمد بن مسلم، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: إن الذي يعلم العلم منكم له أجر مثل أجر المتعلم وله الفضل عليه، فتعلموا العلم من حملة العلم وعلموه إخوانكم كما علمكموه العلماء

[2/19] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad – al-Hasan b. Mahbub – Jamil b. Salih – Muhammad b. Muslim – Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام *who said*: «The one who teaches knowledge from among you has an equivalent reward with the student who seeks knowledge except that he [the teacher] has merit over him [the student]. Therefore, seek knowledge from the bearers of knowledge and teach it to your brothers in the same way as the scholars had taught it to you»<sup>3 4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> al-Qaddah is title that refers to both one Maymun and his son Abdallah b. Maymun, in this case it is the son who is Thiqa which is meant. al-Kulayni narrates this report with two other alternative chains to al-Qaddah both of which are weak. The first is Muhammad b. al-Hasan and Ali b. Muhammad – Sahl b. Ziyad – Ja'far b. Muhammad al-Ash'ari – Abdallah b. Maymun al-Qaddah. The second is Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad – Ja'far b. Muhammad al-Ash'ari – Abdallah b. Maymun al-Qaddah

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/34; See also al-Amali of al-Saduq: 116 No. 9 where it is narrated with the following chain: al-Husayn b. Ibrahim – Ali b. Ibrahim – Ibrahim b. Hashim – Abdallah b. Maymun al-Qaddah

<sup>3</sup> The version of this report in Basair al-Darajat [See Bihar al-Anwar: 1/174] seems to be more accurate: “The one who seeks knowledge from among you has the same [reward] as the one who teaches him, except that he [the teacher] has merit over him. Seek knowledge from the bearers of knowledge and teach it to your brothers in the same way the scholars had taught you”

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/35

[3/20] الخصال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله: من حفظ من امتي أربعين حديثاً مما يحتاجون إليه من أمر دينهم بعثه الله يوم القيامة فقيها عالماً

[3/20] al-Khisal: *The messenger of Allah* صلى الله عليه واله *said*: «Whoever from my Umma memorizes<sup>1</sup> forty narrations which are of benefit to the people - Allah will raise him on the day of judgment as a scholar possessing understanding»<sup>2</sup>

[4/21] العيون: بالاسانيد الثلاثة عن الرضاء عن ابائه عليهم السلام: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله: اللهم ارحم خلفائي- ثلاث مرات - قيل له ومن خلفائك؟ قال: الذين يأتون من بعدي ويروون أحاديثي وسنتي فيعلمونها الناس من بعدي

[4/21] al-Uyun: *Via the three chains*<sup>3</sup> – *al-Ridha – his forefathers* عليهم السلام: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه واله *said*: O Allah have mercy on my successors - thrice. It was said to him: Who are your successors? He said: Those who come after me and transmit my narrations and my Sunna - teaching it to the people after me»<sup>4</sup>

[5/22] رجال النجاشي: عن شيخنا المفيد في كتابه مصابيح النور، أخبرني ابن قولويه، عن علي بن الحسين بن بابويه، عن عبد الله بن جعفر الحميري، عن داود بن القاسم الجعفري قال: عرضت على أبي محمد صاحب العسكر عليه السلام كتاب يوم وليلة ليونس فقال لي: تصنيف من هذا؟ فقلت: تصنيف يونس مولى آل يقطين فقال: أعطاه الله بكل حرف نوراً يوم القيامة

[5/22] Rijal al-Najashi: *al-Mufid in his book "Masabih al-Nur" – Ibn Qulawayh – Ali b. al-Husayn b. Babawayh – Abdallah b. Ja'far al-Himyari – Dawud b. al-Qasim al-Ja'fari who said*: I presented the book "Yawm wa Layla"<sup>5</sup> of Yunus to Abi Muhammad al-Askari عليه السلام. He said to me: «Who authored this?» I said: It has been authored by Yunus the client of the family of Yaqtin. He said: «May Allah give him a light for every letter on the day of judgment»<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Though Hifdh has been rendered as memorization, something along the lines of 'preserves' would be more appropriate. This would involve implementing the Hadith, perpetuating them in the society and making sure the values and practices they propagate do not die out.

<sup>2</sup> al-Khisal: 2/541. al-Majlisi says: "the purport of this report is famous and widely transmitted both among the Khassa and the Amma, infact Tawatur has even been claimed for it ...". The large number of corroborating chains leads to Wuthuq [confidence] about its authenticity even if there is no single reliable chain among them [See: Bihar al-Anwar 1/153 and the pages that follow]

<sup>3</sup> This is a long report from the prophet in the Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha containing many diverse instructions in different topics. It has been narrated by al-Saduq via three different chains - none of which are reliable on their own. It has been included here because al-Muhsini holds the principle that any report being transmitted through three distinct chains generally leads to Wuthuq about the authenticity of the report in question unless there is an indicator which makes us believe otherwise. The three chains have been given in full in the introduction

<sup>4</sup> Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha: 2/40

<sup>5</sup> This was a book outlining the devotional activities recommended to be performed by "day and night"

<sup>6</sup> Rijal al-Najashi: 447 No. 1208

## الباب الخامس: صفة العلماء

### Chapter 5: Attributes of the Scholar

[1/23] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى العطار، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن الحسن بن محبوب عن معاوية بن وهب قال: سمعت أبا عبدالله عليه السلام يقول: اطلبوا العلم وتزينوا معه بالحلم والوقار، وتواضعوا لمن تعلمونه العلم، وتواضعوا لمن طلبتم منه العلم، ولا تكونوا علماء جبارين فيذهب باطلكم بحقكم

[1/23] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya al-Attar – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – al-Hasan b. Mahbub – Muawiya b. Wahb who said: I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «Seek knowledge and adorn yourself with forbearance and dignity together with it. Humble yourself to the one you teach knowledge and humble yourself to the one from whom you seek knowledge. Do not be harsh scholars as a result of which your transgressions make the truth which you speak ineffectual»<sup>1</sup>*

[2/24] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن حماد بن عثمان، عن الحارث بن المغيرة النصري، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام في قول الله عزوجل: إِنَّمَا يَخْشَى اللَّهَ مِنْ عِبَادِهِ الْعُلَمَاءُ قال: يعني بالعلماء من صدق فعله قوله، ومن لم يصدق فعله قوله فليس بعالم

[2/24] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – Muhammad b. Isa – Yunus – Hammad b. Uthman – al-Harith b. al-Mughira al-Nasri – Abi Abdillah عليه السلام in regards the words of Allah Mighty and Majestic: “Verily it is the scholars who truly fear Allah from among His slaves”<sup>2</sup> He said: «He [Allah] refers by ‘the scholars’ to the one whose deeds conform with his words, as for the one whose deeds are contrary to his words then he is not a scholar»<sup>3</sup>*

[3/25] الكافي: عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن إسماعيل بن مهران، عن أبي سعيد القباطي وصالح بن سعيد، عن أبان بن تغلب، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام أنه سئل عن مسألة فأجاب فيها، قال: فقال الرجل: إن الفقهاء لا يقولون هذا، فقال: يا ويحك وهل رأيت فقيها قط؟! إن الفقيه حق الفقيه الزاهد في الدنيا، الراغب في الآخرة، المتمسك بسنة النبي صلى الله عليه وآله

[3/25] al-Kafi: *A number of our companions – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Khalid – Ismail b. Mihran – Abi Sa’id al-Qammat and Salih b. Sa’id – Aban b. Taghlib – Abi Ja’far عليه السلام. He [the Imam] was asked a question about a matter and answered it, then the man [who had asked the question] said: But the Fuqaha do not say this. He said: «Woe be upon you - and have you*

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/36. al-Saduq narrates it in his Amali with the following chain: Ibn al-Mutawakkil – al-Himyari – Ibn Abi al-Khattab – Ibn Mahbub – Muawiya b. Wahb [See: al-Amali of al-Saduq: 440 No. 9]

<sup>2</sup> Qur’an 35:28

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/36

ever seen a Faqih?! A true Faqih is one who renounces the Dunya, covets the Akhera and holds onto the Sunna of the prophet «صلى الله عليه وآله»<sup>1</sup>

[4/26] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، ومحمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان جميعاً، عن صفوان بن يحيى، عن أبي الحسن الرضا عليه السلام قال: إن من علامات الفقه الحلم والصمت

[4/26] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa / Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhl b. Shadhan → Safwan b. Yahya – Abi al-Hasan al-Ridha* *who said:* «From among the signs of understanding are forbearance and silence<sup>2 3</sup>»

[5/27] العيون: بالاسانيد الثلاثة عن الرضا عن ابائه عليهم السلام: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: من حسن فقهه فله حسنة

[5/27] al-Uyun: *Via the three chains – al-Ridha – his forefathers* عليهم السلام: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: Whomsoever's understanding is good then for him will be good<sup>4 5</sup>»

[6/28] الخصال: ابن مسرور، عن ابن عامر، عن عمه عبد الله، عن ابن محبوب، عن ابن صهيب قال: سمعت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام يقول: لا يجمع الله لمنافق ولا فاسق حسن السمات والفقه وحسن الخلق أبداً

[6/28] al-Khisal: *Ibn Masrur – Ibn A'mir – his uncle Abdallah – Ibn Mahbub – Ibn Suhayb who said:* I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «Allah never grants the hypocrite or the corrupt sinner the following [qualities] together: goodness of bearing<sup>6</sup>, understanding and goodness of character<sup>7</sup>»

---

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/70

<sup>2</sup> Fiqh meaning true knowledge which provides understanding of the reality being something that cannot be detected physically requires signs to indicate it. Hilm [forbearance] means keeping away from foolishness and tolerating infringements without reacting with blame, abuse or fights. Samt [silence] means keeping quiet in the face of things that do not concern you and abstaining from vain talk. Once this light is aflame in the heart of someone it takes him to always feel in the divine presence because the veil of mortality does not impede his vision.

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/36

<sup>4</sup> This can either mean that proper understanding is a precondition for the attainment of a goodly reward or that proper understanding is deserving of a reward in of itself

<sup>5</sup> Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha: 2/38

<sup>6</sup> This refers to the way someone carries himself in a dignified way

<sup>7</sup> al-Khisal: 1/127

## الباب السادس: سؤال العالم وتذاكره

### Chapter 6: Asking the Scholar and Discussing with Him

[1/29] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن محمد بن عيسى بن عبيد، عن يونس بن عبدالرحمن عن أبي جعفر الاحول، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: لا يسع الناس حتى يسألوا ويتفقهوا ويعرفوا إمامهم ويسمعهم أن يأخذوا بما يقول وإن كان تقية

[1/29] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – Muhammad b. Isa b. Ubayd – Yunus b. Abd al-Rahman – Abi Ja'far al-Ahwal – Abi Abdillah* who said: «The people are not absolved [freed from responsibility] unless they ask, comprehend and recognize their Imam. It behooves them, however, to take what he [the Imam] says even if it is in Taqiyya [said in dissimulation]»<sup>1</sup>

[2/-] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن حريز عن زرارة ومحمد بن مسلم وبريد العجلي قالوا: قال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام لحران بن أعين في شيء سأله: إنما يهلك الناس لأنهم لا يسألون

[2/-] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Hammad b. Isa – Hariz – Zurara, Muhammad b. Muslim and Burayd al-Ijli* they said: Abu Abdillah said to Humran b. A'yan in regards a matter he had asked him about: «The people are destroyed because they do not ask questions»<sup>2</sup>

[3/30] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن عبدالله بن سنان، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: إن الله عزوجل يقول: تذاكر العلم بين عبادي مما تحيي القلوب الميتة إذا هم انتهوا فيه إلى أمرى

[3/30] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father – Ibn Abi Umayr – Abdallah b. Sinan – Abi Abdillah* who said: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: Allah Mighty and Majestic says: Discussion of knowledge between my slaves is among that which enlivens the dead hearts if it leads them [to submit] to my command»<sup>3</sup>

[4/31] العيون: القطان والنقاش والطلقاتي جميعا عن أحمد الهمداني، عن علي بن الحسن بن فضال، عن أبيه قال: قال الرضا عليه السلام: من تذكر مصابنا فبكى وابكى لم تبك عينه يوم تبكى العيون ومن جلس مجلسا يبكي فيه امرنا لم يميت قلبه يوم تموت القلب

[4/31] al-Uyun: *al-Qattan, al-Naqqash and al-Taliqani – Ahmad al-Hamdani – Ali b. al-Hasan b. Fadhal – his father* who said: al-Ridha عليه السلام said: «Whoever remembers our tribulation then cries and makes other cry will not have his eye cry on the day when the eyes will cry, and

<sup>1</sup> al-Khisal: 1/127

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/40

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/40

whoever attends a gathering wherein our affair is enlivened will not have his heart die<sup>1</sup> on the day when the hearts will die»<sup>2</sup>

[٥/٣٢] علل الشرائع: أبيه، عن سعد، عن ابن يزيد، عن حماد، عن حريز، عن زرارة ومحمد بن مسلم وبريد قالوا: قال رجل لأبي عبد الله عليه السلام: إن لي ابناً قد أحب أن يسألك عن حلال وحرام لا يسألك عما لا يعنيه، قال: فقال عليه السلام: وهل يسأل الناس عن شيء أفضل من الحلال والحرام؟

[5/32] Ilal al-Shara`i: *His father – Sa`d – Ibn Yazid – Hammad – Hariz – Zurara, Muhammad b. Muslim and Burayd they said: A man said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: I have a son who wishes to ask you about the Halal and the Haram - he will not ask you about that which does not concern him, so he عليه السلام said: «And can the people ask about a subject better than the Halal and the Haram?»<sup>3</sup><sup>4</sup>*

[٦/٣٣] الكافي: محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن منصور بن حازم، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: مجالسة أهل الدين شرف الدنيا والآخرة

[6/33] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhil b. Shadhan – Ibn Abi Umayr – Mansur b. Hazm – Abi Abdillah عليه السلام who said: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: Sitting with the people of religion is an honour in the world and the hereafter»<sup>5</sup>*

[٧/٣٤] الخصال: ابن الوليد، عن الصفار، عن البرقي، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن جميل، عن زرارة، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: قال أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام: قوام الدين بأربعة: بعلم ناطق مستعمل له، ويعني لا يبخل بفضله على أهل دين الله، وبفقير لا يبيع آخرته بدينه، وبجاهل لا يتكبر عن طلب العلم، فإذا كتم العالم علمه، وبخل الغني بماله، وباع الفقير آخرته بدينه، واستكبر الجاهل عن طلب العلم، رجعت الدنيا إلى ورائها القهقري، فلا تغرنكم كثرة المساجد وأجساد قوم مختلفة، قيل: يا أمير المؤمنين كيف العيش في ذلك الزمان؟ فقال: خالطوهم بالبرانية وخالقوهم في الباطن، للمرء ما اكتسب، وهو مع من أحب، وانتظروا مع ذلك الفرغ من الله

[7/34] al-Khisal: *Ibn al-Walid – al-Saffar – al-Barqi – his father – Ibn Abi Umayr – Jamil – Zurara – Abi Ja`far عليه السلام who said: «The Commander of the Faithful عليه السلام said: The religion is supported by four: By the knowledgeable person who speaks out and uses it [his knowledge], by the rich person who is not miserly with his bounty [spending it] on the people of the religion of Allah, by the poor person who does not sell off his hereafter for his world, and by the ignorant person who is not too arrogant to seek knowledge. So when it happens that the*

<sup>1</sup> “death of the heart” is a metaphor for the terror, grief, sorrow, and fear on that Day

<sup>2</sup> Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha: 1/264

<sup>3</sup> This is a rhetorical question from the Imam confirming that there is no better science than knowing the permitted and the prohibited as to avoid sins

<sup>4</sup> Ilal al-Shara`i: 2/394

<sup>5</sup> al-Kafi: 1/39

knowledgeable hides his knowledge, and the rich is miserly with his wealth, and the poor sells off his hereafter for his world, and the ignorant is too arrogant to seek knowledge - the world will recede backwards retracing its steps, so the great number of mosques [at that time] and the multitudes of different nations [who pray in them] should not deceive you. It was said: O Commander of the Faithful - how should one live in that age? He said: mingle with them outwardly and oppose them inwardly, it will be for a man what he has earned, and he will be with the one he loves, and wait with that for the relief from Allah»<sup>1</sup>

## الباب السابع: النهي عن القول بغير علم وعن الافتاء بالرأي

### Chapter 7: Prohibition on Speaking without Knowledge and Ruling based on Opinion

[1/35] الكافي: علي، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن عبدالرحمن بن الحجاج قال: قال لي أبو عبد الله عليه السلام إياك وخصلتين ففيها هلك من هلك: إياك أن تفتي الناس برأيك أو تدين بما لا تعلم

[1/35] al-Kafi: *Ali – Muhammad b. Isa b. Ubayd – Yunus – Abd al-Rahman b. al-Hajjaj who said: Abu Abdillah* عليه السلام said to me: «Beware of two qualities - due to them have been destroyed those who have been destroyed - beware of giving Fatwa to the people based on your own opinion or taking as part of your religion that which you have no knowledge of»<sup>2</sup>

[2/36] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن الحسن بن محبوب، عن علي ابن رثاب، عن أبي عميرة الخذاء، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: من أفتى الناس بغير علم ولا هدى لعنته ملائكة الرحمة وملائكة العذاب، ولحقه وزر من عمل بفتياه

[2/36] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – al-Hasan b. Mahbub – Ali b. Riab – Abi Ubayda al-Hadhdha – Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام *who said: «Whoever gives Fatwa to the people without knowledge or true guidance is cursed by the angels of mercy and also the angels of punishment, furthermore, the burden of the one who acts by his Fatwa attaches itself to him»*<sup>3</sup>

[3/37] الكافي: العدة، عن أحمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن الحسن بن علي الوشاء، عن أبان الاحمر، عن زياد بن أبي رجا، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: ما علمتم فقولوا، و ما لم تعلموا فقولوا: الله أعلم، إن الرجل لينتزع الآية من القرآن يخر فيها أبعد ما بين الساء والارض

<sup>1</sup> al-Khisal: 1/197

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/42; It has also been narrated by al-Saduq with a reliable chain [See: al-Khisal: 1/52]

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/42

[3/37] al-Kafi: *A number – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Khalid – al-Hasan b. Ali al-Washsha – Aban al-Ahmar – Ziyad b. Abi Raja – Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام *who said:* «Speak what you know and if you do not know then say: 'Allah is more knowing'. A man selectively picks out a verse from the Qur'an and falls in it [misinterpreting it] a farther distance than what is between the earth and the sky»<sup>1</sup>

[٤/٣٨] الكافي: محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن ربعي بن عبدالله، عن محمد بن مسلم، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: للعالم إذا سئل عن شيء وهو لا يعلمه أن يقول: الله أعلم، وليس لغير العالم أن يقول ذلك

[4/38] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhl b. Shadhan – Hammad b. Isa – Rib'i b. Abdallah – Muhammad b. Muslim – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «It is for the scholar - if he is asked something which he does not know - to say: 'Allah is more knowing' and it is not for other than the scholar to say that»<sup>2</sup>

[٥/٣٩] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن أحمد بن محمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن حريز بن عبدالله، عن محمد بن مسلم، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: إذا سئل الرجل منكم عما لا يعلم فليقل: لا أدري ولا يقل: الله أعلم، فيوقع في قلب صاحبه شكاً وإذا قال المسؤول: لا أدري فلا يتهمه السائل

[5/39] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Khalid – Hammad b. Isa – Hariz b. Abdallah – Muhammad b. Muslim – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «If a man from among you is asked about that which he does not know - he should say: 'I do not know' and should not say: 'Allah is more knowing' because that will cast doubt in the heart of the questioner, and if the questioned says: 'I do not know' then the questioner should not blame him»<sup>3</sup>

[٦/٤٠] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن هشام بن سالم قال: قلت لأبي عبدالله عليه السلام: ما حق الله على خلقه؟ فقال: أن يقولوا ما يعلمون، ويكفوا عما لا يعلمون، فإذا فعلوا ذلك فقد أدوا إلى الله حقه

[6/40] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father – Ibn Abi Umayr – Hisham b. Salim* *who said:* I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: What is the right of Allah over his creation? He said: «That they should only say that which they know and should remain silent over that which they do not know - so if they were to do that then they have fulfilled the right of Allah»<sup>4</sup>

[٧/٤١] الكافي: علي، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن عبد الرحمن بن الحجاج قال: كان أبو عبدالله عليه السلام قاعداً في حلقة ربيعة الرأي، فجاء أعرابي فسأل ربيعة الرأي عن مسألة فأجابه فلما سكت قال له الأعرابي: أهو في عنقك؟ فسكت عنه ربيعة ولم يرد عليه

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/42

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/42

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/42

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/50



شيئا فأعاد عليه المسألة فأجابته بمثل ذلك، فقال له الاعرابي: أهو في عنقك؟ فسكت ربيعة فقال له أبو عبد الله عليه السلام: هو في عنقه، قال أو لم يقل، وكل مفت ضامن

[7/41] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father – Ibn Abi Umayr – Abd al-Rahman b. al-Hajjaj who said:* Abu Abdillah عليه السلام was seated in a study-circle of Rabia al-Rayy when a bedouin came and asked Rabia al-Rayy about a matter and he [Rabia] proceeded to answer him, when he was done [answering] the bedouin asked: Is it upon your neck [do you accept responsibility for me following your answer]? Rabia remained silent and did not say anything, he [the bedouin] repeated the question again and he [Rabia] answered in the same way, the bedouin said to him for the third time: Is it upon your neck? but Rabia remained silent, then Abu Abdillah عليه السلام said to him: «It is upon his neck whether he declares it to be so or not, and every giver of Fatwa is liable»

[٨/٤٢] محمد بن مسعود، عن علي بن الحسن بن فضال، عن العباس بن عامر و جعفر بن محمد بن حكيم، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن أبي بصير قال : سألت أبا جعفر عليه السلام عن شهادة ولد الزنا أ تجوز؟ قال: لا، فقلت: إن الحكم بن عتيبة يزعم أنها تجوز، فقال: اللهم لا تغفر ذنبه، ما قال الله للحكم إِنَّهُ لَذِكْرٌ لَكَ وَ لِقَوْمِكَ، فليذهب الحكم يمينا و شمالا فوالله لا يوجد العلم إلا في أهل بيت نزل عليهم جبريل عليه السلام

[8/42] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Muhammad b. Masud – Ali b. al-Hasan b. Fadhal – al-Abbas b. A'mir and Ja'far b. Muhammad b. Hukaym – Aban b. Uthman – Abi Basir who said:* I asked Aba Ja'far عليه السلام about the witnessing of a Walad Zina [child born out of Nikah] - is it permissible? he عليه السلام said: «No». I said: al-Hakam bin Utayba holds it to be permissible, so he عليه السلام said: «O Allah - do not forgive his sin! Allah was not addressing al-Hakam when He said: “it is a reminder unto you and your Qawm [relations]”<sup>1</sup> - let al-Hakam go to the right and to the left for by Allah he will not find true knowledge except with the Ahl al-Bayt upon whom Jibril عليه السلام descended»<sup>2</sup>

[٩/٤٣] العيون: بالاسانيد الثلاثة عن الرضا، عن ابائه عليهم السلام: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: من افقى الناس بغير علم لعنته ملائكة السموات و الارض

[9/43] al-Uyun: *Via the three chains – al-Ridha – his forefathers* عليهم السلام: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: Whoever gives Fatwa to the people without knowledge is cursed by the angels of the heavens and the earth»<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Qur'an 43:44

<sup>2</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 209 No. 370

<sup>3</sup> Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha: 2/50

## الباب الثامن: لزوم الحجة على العالم وتشديد الأمر عليه

### Chapter 8: Accountability of the Scholar and its Severity

[١/٤٤] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، ومحمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان جميعاً، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن جميل بن دراج قال: سمعت أبا عبدالله عليه السلام يقول: إذا بلغت النفس ههنا - وأشار بيده إلى حلقه - لم يكن للعالم توبة، ثم قرأ: إِنَّمَا التَّوْبَةُ عَلَى اللَّهِ لِلَّذِينَ يَعْمَلُونَ السُّوءَ بِجَهَالَةٍ

[1/44] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father / Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhl b. Shadhan → Ibn Abi Umayr – Jamil b. Darraj who said: I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «When the soul will reach here - and he pointed with his hand to his throat - there will be no repentance for the scholar<sup>1</sup>, then he recited: “Verily repentance is upon Allah only for those who work evil in ignorance”<sup>2 3</sup>»*

[٢/-] الخصال: أبيه، عن الحميري، عن هارون، عن ابن زياد، عن جعفر بن محمد عليه السلام، عن أبيه عليه السلام، عن آبائه عليه السلام: أن علياً قال: إن في جهنم رحي تطحن أفلا تسألوني ما طحنها؟ فقيل له: وما طحنها يا أمير المؤمنين؟ قال: العلماء الفجرة، والقراء الفسقة، والجبارة الظلمة، والوزراء الخونة، والعرفاء الكذبة. وإن في النار لمدينة يقال لها: الحصينة، أفلا تسألوني ما فيها؟ فقيل: وما فيها يا أمير المؤمنين؟ فقال: فيها أيدي الناكثين

[2/-] al-Khisal: *His father – al-Himyari – Harun<sup>4</sup> – Ibn Ziyad – Ja’far b. Muhammad عليه السلام – his father عليه السلام – his forefathers عليهم السلام that: Ali عليه السلام said: «There is in hell a millstone which grinds - will you not ask what it grinds?» It was said to him: And what does it grind O Commander of the Faithful? He said: «Corrupt scholars, sinful reciters [of the Qur’an], unjust tyrants, treacherous ministers, and lying officials<sup>5</sup>. There is also in hell a city called ‘The Fortified’*

<sup>1</sup> The scholar - unlike the ignorant - will not have an opportunity for repentance in these last moments before the veil of the unseen is lifted, after which repentance becomes impossible for all. One reason that has been proposed to explain this dichotomy is that the sins of the scholar were done with full knowledge thereby subtly affecting the internal state of the soul and core personality, these cannot be effaced in such short period of time. On the other hand, the sins of most heedless and ignorant individuals are limited to physical desires and external shortcomings which can be overcome in a moment of sincerity

<sup>2</sup> Qur’an 4:17

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/47

<sup>4</sup> The chain will only be connected if one assumes that Harun had a very long life (approximately 130 years). This being far-fetched the report is not considered reliable

<sup>5</sup> ‘lying officials’ is a translation of the Arabic Urafa [plural for Arif - lit. ‘person who knows’]. The knowledge they possessed was to do with Urf [customs] and societal conventions not the knowledge of the Diin which belonged to the Ulama [sing. Alim]. An Arif was responsible for the administration of certain tribal or military units called Irafa, they collected taxes, distributed stipends, maintained the Diwan [register of names] and arbitrated conflicts. Significantly, they also reported back their units’ doings to the governor and could be held responsible for their men’s rebellion or misconduct.

- will you not ask me what is in it?» It was said: What is in it O Commander of the Faithful? He said: «In it are the hands of the oath-breakers<sup>1 2</sup>»

[3/45] معاني الاخبار: أبيه، عن سعد، عن ابن أبي الخطاب، عن ابن محبوب، عن حماد بن عثمان، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام في قول الله عز وجل: وَالشُّعْرَاءُ يَتَّبِعُهُمُ الْغَاوُونَ قال: هل رأيت شاعرا يتبعه أحد؟ إنما هم قوم تفقهوا لغير الدين فضلوا وأضلوا

[3/45] Ma'ani al-Akhbar: *His father – Sa'd – Ibn Abi al-Khattab – Ibn Mahbub – Hammad b. Uthman – Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام in regards the words of Allah Mighty and Majestic: “and the poets - only the astray follow them”<sup>3</sup> He said: «Have you seen anyone following the poet? rather it [‘poets’ in the verse] refers to a group who sought knowledge for other than the religion so they became misguided and also misguided others<sup>4 5</sup>»

## باب التاسع: النوادر والمتفرقات

### Chapter 9: Miscellaneous

[1/46] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن أبي نصر، عن حماد بن عثمان، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: نعم وزير الايمان العلم، ونعم وزير العلم الحلم، ونعم وزير الحلم الرفق، ونعم وزير الرفق الصبر

[1/46] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Abi Nasr – Hammad b. Uthman – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: The best assistant to faith is knowledge, the best assistant to knowledge is

<sup>1</sup> The hands of the Nakithin [oath-breakers] are singled out because it is what they used to give their false pledges of allegiance before betrayal

<sup>2</sup> al-Khisal: 1/296. All the five categories of people mentioned by the Imam have certain responsibilities within the society or in other words are in positions of authority. They may be Scholars, Qurra [a professional class of people who were experts on the text of the Qur'an, having memorized it, deeming themselves its guardians and tutors], rulers, their assistants, and the lower-level bureaucracy. If a society is to prosper all these have to be honest brokers with good intentions

<sup>3</sup> Qur'an 26:224

<sup>4</sup> In the Imam's interpretation, the 'poets' in the verse refers to scholars who seek knowledge for worldly benefit. This identification with poets is because just like the latter such scholars base their output [religious rulings] on personal whims and flights of fancy instead of any solid foundation, thereby creating an unrecognizable religion and misguiding their followers

<sup>5</sup> Ma'ani al-Akhbar: 385

forbearance, the best assistant to forbearance is compassion and the best assistant to compassion is patience»<sup>1</sup>

[٢/٤٧] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن معمر بن خلاد قال: سمعت أبا الحسن الرضا عليه السلام يقول: ليس العبادة كثرة الصلاة والصوم، إنما العبادة التفكير في أمر الله عزوجل

[2/47] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Muammar b. Khallad who said: I heard Aba al-Hasan al-Ridha عليه السلام saying: «Worship is not excessive prayers or fasting, worship is reflecting over the affair<sup>2</sup> of Allah Mighty and Majestic»<sup>3</sup>*

[٣/٤٨] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن الحسن بن علي بن فضال عن ابن بكير، عن عميد بن زرارة قال: قال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام: احتفظوا بكتبكم فإنكم سوف تحتاجون إليها

[3/48] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – al-Hasan b. Ali b. Fadhal – Ibn Bukayr – Ubayd b. Zurara who said: Abu Abdillah عليه السلام said: «Preserve your books for you are going to have need of them<sup>4 5</sup>»*

[٤/٤٩] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن أبي نصر، عن جميل بن دراج قال: قال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام: أعربوا حديثنا فانا قوم فصحاء

[4/49] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Abi Nasr – Jamil b. Darraj who said: Abu Abdillah عليه السلام said: «Arabize<sup>6</sup> our narrations for we are an eloquent people»<sup>7</sup>*

[٥/٥٠] الخصال: أبيه، عن سعد، عن البرقي، عن الحسن بن علي بن فضال، عن ثعلبة، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: الرجال ثلاثة: رجل بماله، ورجل بجاهه، ورجل بلسانه، وهو أفضل الثلاثة

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/48

<sup>2</sup> 'thinking over the affair of Allah' means pondering over the greatness of God and His creation which leads to His recognition, a prerequisite for true worship

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 2/55

<sup>4</sup> There is an allusion here to the impending age where the Imam will not be directly accessible

<sup>5</sup> al-Kafi: 1/53

<sup>6</sup> When you report from memory and attribute meanings to the `Aimma you should do so following the correct grammatical rules and pronunciation [as the Imam must have done]. You should also use the loftiest forms of speech and turns of phrase as befitting the station of the `Aimma lest you diminish them in any way in the ear of the listener

<sup>7</sup> al-Kafi: 1/53

[5/50] al-Khisal: *His father – Sa'd – al-Barqi – al-Hasan b. Ali b. Fadhal – Tha'laba – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «Men are of three kinds: a man by his wealth, a man by his position, and a man by his tongue [good speaker], and the latter is the best of the three<sup>1 2</sup>»

## باب العاشر: رواية الحديث بالمعنى

### Chapter 10: Transmitting the Narration Non-Verbatim

[1/51] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن محمد بن الحسين، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن ابن أذينة، عن محمد بن مسلم قال: قلت لابي عبدالله عليه السلام: أسمع الحديث منك فأزيد وأنقص؟ قال: إن كنت تريد معانيه فلا بأس

[1/51] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Muhammad b. al-Husayn – Ibn Abi Umayr – Ibn Udhayna – Muhammad b. Muslim who said:* I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: I hear a narration from you - am I allowed to add or decrease [some words to/from it]? He said: «If you intend to convey the same meaning then there is no harm<sup>3 4</sup>»

[2/52] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد ومحمد بن الحسين، عن ابن محبوب، عن عبدالله بن سنان قال: قلت لابي عبدالله عليه السلام: يجيئني القوم فيستمعون مني حديثكم فأضجر ولا أقوى قال: فافقرأ عليهم من أوله حديثا ومن وسطه حديثا ومن آخره حديثا

[2/52] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad and Muhammad b. al-Husayn – Ibn Mahbub – Abdallah b. Sinan who said:* I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: A group comes and hears your narrations from me - but I may feel weary and do not have the strength [to read all that I have to them], he said: «Then read for them from the beginning of it [the book] a narration, from the middle a narration and from the ending a narration»<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Power of oratory is the most superior material blessing over and above wealth or rank

<sup>2</sup> al-Khisal: 1/116

<sup>3</sup> The Imam permits a narrator to transmit reports from him non-verbatim i.e. based on his recollection of what the Imam said and not using the exact words of the Imam. This was widely practised in the oral culture of the time. The main condition being that the meaning of the report should not change in the paraphrasing of the narrator, for this, the narrator has to have understood the narration fully to be able to rephrase it correctly.

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/51

<sup>5</sup> al-Kafi: 1/51-52. It was the practice of the Ashab to hold sessions wherein the Shaykh goes over the narrations he has obtained from the Imam to his students [Qira'a] while they listen to his recital [Sima'a]. The report also confirms that narrations were already in written form as the Imam instructs Ibn Sinan to read a Hadith from the 'beginning', 'middle' and 'end' which only makes sense if they were recorded in a 'book'. Further, we find support herein for the practice of reading a few narrations from the book as a form of Tabarruk [blessing] and giving Ijaza [license] for the students to transmit the book after copying the rest of the book for themselves

## الباب الحادي عشر: التقليد المحرم

### Chapter 11: Prohibition of Blind Following

[1/53] الكافي: محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن ربعي ابن عبدالله، عن أبي بصير، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام في قول الله عزوجل: اتَّخَذُوا أَحْبَابَهُمْ وَرُهْبَانَهُمْ أَرْبَابًا مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فقال: والله ما صاموا لهم ولا صلوا لهم ولكن أحلوا لهم حراما وحرّموا عليهم حلالا فاتبعوهم

[1/53] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhli b. Shadhan – Hammad b. Isa – Rib'i b. Abdallah – Abi Basir – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام in regards the words of Allah Mighty and Majestic: "They took their rabbis and monks as lords besides Allah"<sup>1</sup> He said: «By Allah - they did not fast for them nor did they pray to them but they [the rabbis and monks] made permissible for them the prohibited and prohibited for them the permissible and they followed them»<sup>2</sup>

## الباب الثاني عشر: حول البدعة والقياس

### Chapter 12: Regarding Innovation and Analogical Reasoning

[1/54] الكافي: الحسين بن محمد الاشعري، عن معلى بن محمد، عن الحسن بن علي الوشاء، و عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن فضال جميعا، عن عاصم بن حميد، عن محمد ابن مسلم، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: خطب أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام الناس فقال: أيها الناس إنما بدء وقوع الفتن أهواء تتبع، وأحكام تبتدع، يخالف فيها كتاب الله، يتولى فيها رجال رجلا، فلو أن الباطل خالص لم يخف على ذي حجي، ولو أن الحق خالص لم يكن اختلاف ولكن يؤخذ من هذا ضغث ومن هذا ضغث فيمزجان فيجيطان معا فهناك استحوذ الشيطان على أوليائه ونجا الذين سبقت لهم من الله الحسنى

[1/54] al-Kafi: *al-Husayn b. Muhammad al-Ash'ari – Mualla b. Muhammad – al-Hasan b. Ali al-Washsha / A number of our companions – Ahmad b. Muhammad – Ibn Fadhali –> A'sim b. Humayd – Muhammad b. Muslim – Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام *who said:* «The Commander of the Faithful عليه السلام addressed the people and said: O people - verily the beginning of the occurrence of strife is due to desires being followed and laws being innovated<sup>3</sup> - in which the book of Allah is opposed and in which men follow other men. If falsehood were to be completely distinct it would not be hidden from anyone who possesses intellect, and if truth were to be completely distinct there would not be any disagreement. But it is taken from this [falsehood] a

<sup>1</sup> Qur'an 9:31

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/53

<sup>3</sup> Innovation refers to introducing into Islam something which is foreign and inimical to it

handful and from that [truth] a handful and then mixed and presented together, this is whence Satan overwhelms his allies whilst are saved those to whom had preceded grace from Allah»<sup>1</sup>

[٢/٥٥] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن محمد بن عيسى بن عبيد، عن يونس بن عبدالرحمن، عن سماعه بن مهران، عن أبي الحسن موسى عليه السلام قال: قلت: أصلحك الله إنا نجتمع فنتذاكر ما عندنا فلا يرد علينا شيء إلا وعندنا فيه شيء مسطر وذلك مما أنعم الله به علينا بكم، ثم يرد علينا الشيء الصغير ليس عندنا فيه شيء فينظر بعضنا إلى بعض، وعندنا ما يشبهه فنقيس على أحسنه؟ فقال: وما لكم وللقياس؟ إنما هلك من هلك من قبلكم بالقياس، ثم قال: إذا جاءكم ما تعلمون، فقولوا به وإن جاءكم ما لا تعلمون فيها - وأهوى بيده إلى فيه - ثم قال: لعن الله أبا حنيفة كان يقول: قال علي وقلت أنا، وقالت الصحابة وقلت، ثم قال: أكنت تجلس إليه؟ فقلت: لا ولكن هذا كلامه، فقلت: أصلحك الله أتى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله الناس بما يكتفون به في عهده؟ قال: نعم وما يحتاجون إليه إلى يوم القيامة، فقلت: فضاع من ذلك شيء؟ فقال: لا هو عند أهله

[2/55] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – Muhammad b. Isa b. Ubayd – Yunus b. Abd al-Rahman – Sama'a b. Mihran – Abi al-Hasan Musa* عليه السلام. I [Sama'a] said: May Allah make you prosper - we gather and discuss what we have [from you], nothing is referred to us [of questions] except that we have in it something [answer] recorded [on your authority], and that is from what Allah has blessed us with through you. However, a small thing may be referred to us in which we have nothing [from you], so we look at one another [hopelessly], but we do have something similar to it [answers from you about parallel scenarios] - should we analogize it [the question asked] with the most suited [closest scenario]? He said: «What do you have to do with analogical reasoning? Verily they were destroyed those who were destroyed before you because of analogical reasoning<sup>2</sup>». Then he said: «If it comes to you that which you have knowledge of then - say, and if it comes to you that which you do not know then - and he pointed with his hand to his mouth [i.e. keep silent]». Then he said: «May Allah curse Aba Hanifa he used to say: 'Ali said such and such but I say ...' and 'the companions said such and such but I say ...'»<sup>3</sup>. Then he said: «Did you use to sit with him [in his teaching sessions]?» I said: No, but these are his words. Then I said: May Allah make you prosper - did the messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله come with all that which would suffice the people in his time? He said: «Yes, and even that which they will

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/54

<sup>2</sup> Rejection of Qiyas [Analogical reasoning] is the cornerstone of Shi'i jurisprudence. All forms of Qiyas involve extending the agreed-upon solution of one problem to a 'related' problem for which there is no clear solution. The Imams considered the process error-prone and ultimately superfluous in the face of the fact that they had knowledge of the correct solutions to all problems as inherited from the prophet

<sup>3</sup> Abu Hanifa used to cite what he considered to be the opinion of Ali or other companions and then give his own contradicting opinion which he took as authoritative. This means that he considered himself on the same plane as the companions and equally justified in making Ijtihad even if it goes against them

have need of up to the day of judgment» I said: Has anything from that been lost? He said: «No, it is with his family»<sup>1</sup>

[3/56] الكافي: علي، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن قتيبة قال: سأل رجل أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن مسألة فأجابه فيها، فقال الرجل: أرأيت إن كان كذا وكذا ما يكون القول فيها؟ فقال له: مه ما أجبتك فيه من شيء فهو عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله لسنا من "أرأيت" في شيء

[3/56] al-Kafi: *Ali – Muhammad b. Isa – Yunus – Qutayba who said: A man asked Aba Abdillah عليه السلام about an issue and he answered him, the man said: Suppose if it were so and so - what would the answer then be? So he [the Imam] said to him: «Keep silent, whatever answer I have given then it is on the authority of the messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله, we have nothing to do with 'suppose' whatsoever»<sup>3</sup>*

[4/57] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن الحسن بن محبوب، عن معاوية بن وهب قال: سمعت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام يقول: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: إن عند كل بدعة تكون من بعدي يكاد بها الايمان وليا من أهل بيتي موكلا به يذب عنه، ينطق بإلهام من الله ويعلم الحق وينوره، ويرد كيد الكائدين، يعبر عن الضعفاء فاعتبروا يا أولي الابصار وتوكلوا على الله

[4/57] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – al-Hasan b. Mahbub – Muawiya b. Wahb who said: I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله said: For every innovation that arises after me - by which is sought the weakening of the faith - there will be a guardian from the people of my house in charge of it [faith] who will defend it. He will speak by inspiration from Allah and will proclaim the truth and illuminate it. He will repulse the plot of the plotters and speak out in defense of the weak ones. So pay heed O possessors of insight and rely upon Allah»<sup>4</sup>*

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/57

<sup>2</sup> The Imam picks up on this phrase "a-ra'aita" because it was the distinctive feature of a new system of legal reasoning called Ra'y which had begun in influential Kufan circles associated with Abu Hanifa. Ra'y developed because of the need to deal with areas of the law beyond the literal scope of the revealed texts, a problem in proto-Sunnism but not Imami Shi'ism [which had continued access to authoritative verdicts from the Imam]. Ra'y debates used the dialectic method where there is a progressive exchange of propositions and counter-propositions probing the details of particular hypothetical situations through questions and answers. These were often introduced by the interrogatory phrase a-ra'aita ["is it not the case that" or, "tell me your opinion about"]. Those engaged in Ra'y were also referred to as "the people of a-ra'aita, a-ra'aita" thus we see the Imam denouncing the system and its practitioners by saying 'we have nothing to do with a-ra'aita' whatsoever'

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/58

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/54



[٥/٥٨] الكافي: محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن الوشاء، عن مثنى الحنيط، عن أبي بصير قال: قلت لابي عبدالله عليه السلام: ترد علينا أشياء ليس نعرفها في كتاب الله ولا سنة فننظر فيها؟ فقال: لا، أما إنك إن أصبت لم تؤجر، وإن أخطأت كذبت على الله عز وجل

[5/58] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Yahya – Ahmad b. Muhammad – al-Washsha – Muthanna al-Hannat – Abi Basir who said: I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: Things are referred to us about which we have no knowledge in the Book of Allah nor the Sunna - should we exercise reason in them? He said: «No, for even if you were to get it right you will not be rewarded for it, and if you were to err in it then you have lied upon Allah Mighty and Majestic»*<sup>1</sup>

[٦/٥٩] الكافي: محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن صفوان بن يحيى، عن عبد الرحمن بن الحجاج، عن أبان بن تغلب، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: إن السنة لا تقاس ألا ترى أن امرأة تقضي صومها ولا تقضي صلاتها يا أبان! إن السنة إذا قيست بحق الدين

[6/59] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhl b. Shadhan – Safwan b. Yahya – Abd al-Rahman b. al-Hajjaj – Aban b. Taghlib – Abi Abdillah عليه السلام who said: «The Sunna cannot be derived through analogy - do you not see that a woman repays her fasts but does not repay her prayers. O Aban! If the Sunna is analogized then the religion is destroyed»*<sup>2</sup>

[٧/٦٠] التوحيد: ابن المتوكل، عن علي، عن أبيه، عن الريان بن الصلت، عن علي بن موسى الرضا، عن آبائه، عن أمير المؤمنين عليهم السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله: قال الله جل جلاله: ما آمن بي من فسر برأيه كلامي، وما عرفني من شبهني بخلفي وما على ديني من استعمل القياس في ديني

[7/60] al-Tawhid: *Ibn al-Mutawakkil – Ali – his father – al-Rayyan b. al-Salt – Ali b. Musa al-Ridha – his forefathers – The Commander of the Faithful عليهم السلام who said: «The messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه واله said: Allah Majestic is His Majesty said: he has not believed in Me the one who interprets My words based on his opinion, he has not known Me the one who compares Me to My creation, and he is not upon My religion the one who uses analogical reasoning in it»*<sup>3</sup>

[٨/٦١] معاني الاخبار: ابن الوليد، عن الصفار، عن احمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن الأهوازي، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن حاد، عن الحلبي قال: قلت لابي عبدالله عليه السلام: ما أدنى ما يكون به العبد كافراً؟ قال: أن يتدع شيئاً فيتولى عليه ويرأى من خالفه

[8/61] Ma'ani al-Akhbar: *Ibn al-Walid – al-Saffar – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – al-Ahwazi – Ibn Abi Umayr – Hammad – al-Halabi who said: I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: What is the*

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/56

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/57

<sup>3</sup> al-Tawhid: 1/68; the same narration is also found in al-Amali of al-Saduq: 55 No. 3 and Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha: 1/107

least thing by which a slave becomes Kafir? He said: «That he innovates something and associates solely on its basis and disassociates from the one who opposes him [in it]»<sup>1</sup>

[٩/٦٢] معاني الاخبار: وبهذا الاسناد عن ابن عيسى، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن ابن اذينة، عن بريد العجلي قال: قلت لابي عبد الله عليه السلام: ما أدنى ما يصير به العبد كافرا؟ قال: فأخذ حصاة من الارض فقال: أن يقول لهذه الحصاة: إنها نواة، ويبرء من خالفه على ذلك، ويدين الله بالبراءة ممن قال بغير قوله، فهذا ناصب قد أشرك بالله وكفر من حيث لا يعلم

[9/62] Ma'ani al-Akhbar: *Ibn al-Walid – al-Saffar – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Ibn Abi Umayr – Ibn Udhayna – Burayd al-Ijli who said: I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: What is the least thing by which a slave becomes Kafir? So he took a pebble from the ground and said: «That he says about this pebble 'it is a date-stone' and goes on to disassociate from anyone who opposes him in that<sup>2</sup>, and he worships Allah by disassociating from the one who professes a belief other than his own, so this is a hostile opponent who has ascribed partners to Allah and disbelieved without knowing»<sup>3</sup>*

[١٠/٦٣] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن محمد بن عيسى بن عبيد، عن يونس، عن حريز عن زرارة قال: سألت أبا عبد الله عليه السلام عن الحلال والحرام فقال: حلال محمد حلال أبدا إلى يوم القيامة، وحرامه حرام أبدا إلى يوم القيامة، لا يكون غيره ولا يجيء غيره، وقال: قال علي عليه السلام: ما أحد ابتدع بدعة إلا ترك بها سنة

[10/63] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – Muhammad b. Isa b. Ubayd – Yunus – Hariz – Zurara who said: I asked Aba Abdillah عليه السلام about the Halal and the Haram so he said: «The Halal of Muhammad is Halal forever unto the day of judgment and his Haram is Haram forever unto the day of judgment, there will be nothing other than it and nothing apart from it will come». He also said: «Ali عليه السلام said: No one has innovated a Bid'a except that he has abandoned a Sunna [by doing so]»<sup>4</sup>*

<sup>1</sup> Ma'ani al-Akhbar: 282

<sup>2</sup> When someone considers his own opinion [which has no basis in the religion] to be so great as to make even reality bend towards it and not otherwise, holds onto his pre-formed beliefs even in the face of evidence and refuses to follow the truth, sets them upon a such pedestal that he judges others based on that standard then for sure he has disbelieved by usurping for himself the right that belongs only to Allah and thus committed Shirk

<sup>3</sup> Ma'ani al-Akhbar: 393

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/58

## الباب الثالث عشر: حكم كل شيء في الكتاب والسنة

### Chapter 13: Ruling of Everything is in the Book and the Sunna

[1/64] الكافي: علي، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن حماد، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: سمعته يقول: ما من شيء إلا وفيه كتاب أو سنة

[1/64] al-Kafi: *Ali – Muhammad b. Isa – Yunus – Hammad – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام. He [Hammad] said: I heard him saying: «There isn't a thing except there is about it [a ruling in the Book or Sunna]<sup>1</sup>

[2/65] الكافي: عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن علي بن النعمان، عن إسماعيل بن جابر، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: كتاب الله فيه نبأ ما قبلكم وخبر ما بعدكم وفصل ما بينكم ونحن نعلمه

[2/65] al-Kafi: *A number of our companions – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Ali b. al-Nu'man – Ismail b. Jabir – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said:* «The Book of Allah - in it is an account of what came before you, a report of what will come after you and a judgment of what is between you [of differences] - and we do know it [all]»<sup>2</sup>

[3/66] الكافي: عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن إسماعيل بن مهران، عن سيف بن عميرة، عن أبي المغراء، عن سماعه، عن أبي الحسن موسى عليه السلام قال: قلت له: أكل شيء في كتاب الله وسنة نبيه صلى اليه عليه وآله؟ أو تقولون فيه؟ قال: بل كل شيء في كتاب الله وسنة نبيه صلى الله عليه وآله

[3/66] al-Kafi: *A number of our companions – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Khalid – Ismail b. Mihran – Sayf b. Umayra – Abi al-Maghra – Sama'a – Abi al-Hasan Musa* عليه السلام. He [Sama'a] said: I said to him: Is everything in the book of Allah and the Sunna of his prophet صلى الله عليه وآله or do you have a say in it? He said: «Rather everything is in the book of Allah and the Sunna of the prophet صلى الله عليه وآله»<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/59. 'Everything is in the Book and the Sunna' means that there is a general rule that applies to any scenario possible, not that they contain details for an infinite number of problems, some of which are only arising in modern times

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/61

<sup>3</sup> al-Kafi: 1/62. The motive of the questioner was to ask whether the 'Aimma apply their own reasoning to derive the law in cases where there is no explicit proof-texts [Nass] in the revelatory sources, the way the Mujtahidin do by considering circumstantial evidence [Qarain] etc. This report indicates that the Imam does not have a role in the Law beyond exposition of what is in the Book and the Sunna, the comprehensive knowledge of which they have inherited from the Prophet. Since 'everything' is in the Book and the Sunna, and they possess certain knowledge of its contents, the question of 'probabilistic doubt' in the process of Ijtihad does not arise

## الباب الرابع عشر: النهي عن المجادلة والخصومة

### Chapter 14: Prohibition on Debate and Argumentation<sup>1</sup>

[1/-] أمالي الصدوق: أبيه، عن الحميري، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن محمد بن حمران، عن الحذاء قال: قال أبو جعفر عليه السلام: يا زياد إياك والخصومات فإنها تورث الشك، وتحبط العمل، وتردي صاحبها، وعسى أن يتكلم الرجل بالشئ لا يغفر له ...

[1/-] Amali al-Saduq: *His father – al-Himyari – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – his father – Ibn Abi Umayr – Muhammad b. Humran – al-Hadhha who said: Abu Ja'far عليه السلام said: «O Ziyad - beware of argumentation [in matters of religion]<sup>2</sup> because it creates doubt, nullifies deeds and degrades its initiator. It might also happen that a man speaks something for which he is never forgiven ...»<sup>3</sup>*

[2/67] أمالي الصدوق: ابن المتوكل، عن الحميري، عن ابن عيسى، عن ابن محبوب، عن عنبسة العابد، عن أبي عبد الله الصادق عليه السلام قال: إياكم والخصومة في الدين فإنها تشغل القلب عن ذكر الله عز وجل وتورث النفاق وتكسب الضغائن وتستجبر الكذب

[2/67] Amali al-Saduq: *Ibn al-Mutawakkil – al-Himyari – Ibn Isa – Ibn Mahbub – Anbasa al-A'bid – Abi Abdillah al-Sadiq عليه السلام who said: «Beware of argumentation in the religion for it diverts the heart from the remembrance of Allah Mighty and Majestic, leads to hypocrisy, results in rancour and justifies the borrowing of lies [to win]»<sup>4</sup>*

<sup>1</sup> Looking at all the narration of this chapter together and reconciling between them, one can say that what the the 'Aimma were opposed to was a particular form. There is no problem with 'disputation' or 'debate' if conducted while avoiding the usual pitfalls, like causing fights, splitting hairs in insignificant matters, looking for faults, considering oneself as always right, debating for the sake of debating, debating merely for the sake of winning, obtaining the admiration of people, taking pride in oneself, propping up one's own side even if one recognizes that the arguments used are weak. However, if debate is conducted in order to make the truth known, dispel the doubts people have about the religion, and guiding the errant then it is one of the pillars of religion. Having said this, it is very difficult to distinguish between the two in practice and one must be in-constant check of his motivations which have a way of concealing themselves, except for the one Allah has extended His grace to. The different Arabic words used in these reports when referring to the prohibited form will be rendered as 'argumentation' to preserve its negative connotation

<sup>2</sup> al-Majlisi restricts the discussions that are prohibited to those involving the attempt to describe the essence of God, the nature of His attributes, the question of free-will and determinism and the like. In other words, difficult abstract thinking which can create doubts and lead to disbelief.

<sup>3</sup> al-Amali of al-Saduq: 503 No. 689. The reliability of the chain is dependant on Ibn Humran being al-Nahdi and the father of Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa being considered 'praised' which is unconfirmed

<sup>4</sup> al-Amali of al-Saduq: 503 No. 691

[3/68] الخصال: ابن المتوكل، عن الحميري، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن ابن محبوب، عن أبي ولاد، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: كان علي بن الحسين عليها السلام يقول: إن المعرفة بكمال دين المسلم تركه الكلام فيما لا يعنيه، وقلة المرء، وحلمه، وصبره، وحسن خلقه

[3/68] al-Khisal: *Ibn al-Mutawakkil – al-Himyari – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isa – Ibn Mahbub – Abi Wallad – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said*: «Ali b. al-Husayn عليها السلام used to say: The perfection of the religion of a Muslim can be recognized by looking at him avoiding talk which does not concern him, minimizing arguments, having forbearance, patience and good character»<sup>1</sup>

[4/69] رجال الكشي: حمدويه، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن حماد قال: كان أبو الحسن عليه السلام يأمر محمد بن حكيم أن يجالس أهل المدينة في مسجد رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله وأن يكلمهم ويخاصمهم حتى كلمهم في صاحب القبر وكان إذا انصرف إليه قال: ما قلت لهم وما قالوا لك ويرضى بذلك منه

[4/69] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh – Muhammad b. Isa – Yunus – Hammad who said*: Abu al-Hasan عليه السلام used to order Muhammad b. Hukaym to sit with the people of Madina in the Masjid of the messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه واله and talk to them and debate with them - such that he even debated with them regarding the companion of the grave [i.e. Abu Bakr] - and when he [Muhammad b. Hukaym] used to go to meet him [the Imam] - he [the Imam] would ask: «How did you argue with them [which points did you use]»? How did they argue with you?» and he used to be pleased with that from him<sup>3</sup>

[5/70] رجال الكشي: حمدويه ومحمد ابنا نصير، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن علي بن الحكم، عن أبان الأحمر، عن الطيار قال: قلت لأبي عبد الله عليه السلام: بلغني أنك كرهت مناظرة الناس فقال: أما كلام مثلك فلا يكره، من إذا طار يحسن أن يقع، وإن وقع يحسن أن يطير، فمن كان هكذا لا نكرهه

[5/70] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh and Muhammad the two sons of Nusayr – Muhammad b. Isa – Ali b. al-Hakam – Aban al-Ahmar – al-Tayyar who said*: I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: It has reached me that you dislike us debating the people? He said: «As for the speaking of someone like you then it is not disliked, the one who if he flies<sup>4</sup> is able to land well, and when he lands is able to fly well, whomever is like this then we do not dislike him [to debate]»<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup> al-Khisal: 1/290

<sup>2</sup> These debates were highly formalized and required on the spot reasoning. It would be easy to stray from the firm groundings of revelatory knowledge into error. This report confirms that there were some companions like Muhammad b. Hukaym [and Ibn al-Tayyar – see below] who were allowed to engage in them by the Imam because of their mastery

<sup>3</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 449 No. 844

<sup>4</sup> The allegory that the Imam makes of flying is an allusion to the title of al-Tayyar [‘the winged one’]

<sup>5</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 348 No. 650

[٦/٧١] رجال الكشي: حمدويه ومحمد، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن هشام بن الحكم قال: قال لي أبو عبد الله عليه السلام: ما فعل ابن الطيار؟ قال: قلت: مات قال: رحمه الله ولقاءه نضرة وسرورا فقد كان شديد الخصومة عنا أهل البيت

[6/71] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh and Muhammad – Muhammad b. Isa – Ibn Abi Umayr – Hisham b. al-Hakam who said*: Abu Abdillah عليه السلام said to me: «What happened to Ibn al-Tayyar?» I said: he died. He said: «May Allah have mercy on him and grant him radiance and joy, for he was an intensely vocal defender<sup>1</sup> on our behalf - the Ahl al-Bayt»<sup>2</sup>

[٧/٧٢] رجال الكشي: حمدويه ومحمد، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن أبي جعفر الأحول عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: ما فعل ابن الطيار؟ فقلت: توفي فقال: رحمه الله أدخل الله عليه الرحمة والنضرة فإنه كان يخاصم عنا أهل البيت

[7/72] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh and Muhammad – Muhammad b. Isa – Yunus – Abi Ja'far al-Ahwal – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام *who said*: «What happened to Ibn al-Tayyar?»<sup>3</sup> I said: he died. He said: «May Allah have mercy on him and make mercy and radiance enter upon him, for he used to verbally defend us the Ahl al-Bayt»<sup>4</sup>

[٨/-] رجال الكشي: حمدويه، عن ابن يزيد، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن محمد بن حكيم قال: ذكر لأبي الحسن عليه السلام أصحاب الكلام فقال: أما ابن حكيم فدعوه

[8/-] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh – Ibn Yazid – Ibn Abi Umayr – Muhammad b. Hukaym who said*: The names of those who engaged in Kalam [theological disputation] were mentioned to Abi al-Hasan عليه السلام - so he said: «As for Ibn Hukaym then leave him be<sup>5</sup>»<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup> The same word الخصومة that has been used with a negative connotation in the previous reports has been used here to extol al-Tayyar, this shows that 'debate' can be praiseworthy if done right as had been mentioned before. This requires knowledge, sincerity and to make sure that one engages in it only when it is relevant and for the right reasons, otherwise it will harden the heart

<sup>2</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 349 No. 651

<sup>3</sup> al-Tayyar and Ibn al-Tayyar in these reports refer to the same person - Muhammad b. Abdallah al-Tayyar who was a companion of al-Sadiq

<sup>4</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 349 No. 652

<sup>5</sup> It is clear that these names were mentioned to the Imam in a negative context because of their association with Kalam. But as the Imam had made clear to al-Tayyar, see [5/70] above, the problem was not Kalam in of itself, but the ability of the practitioner to maintain balance which was in question. The Imams were aware that Kalam could open the door to a rationality without any checks in revelation. It is because of the dangers of this that the 'Aimma took a negative stance towards Kalam and frowned upon it for most of the Ashab. An anthem that stuck in the minds of the general laity. This explains why some of the most prominent companions of the 'Aimma who were recognized theologians attracted controversy and had to be defended by the Imams against censure from other wings of the Imamiyya who were strict traditionalists not aware of this nuance. The Imam excludes Ibn Hukaym [as an exception to the general rule] because of his confidence in him

<sup>6</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 448 No. 843

## الباب الخامس عشر: بعض الاسباب في اختلاف الاحاديث

### Chapter 15: Some Reasons for Differences between Narrations

[١/٧٣] رجال الكشي: ابن مسعود، عن علي بن الحسن، عن العباس بن عامر وجعفر ابن محمد بن حكيم، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن أبي بصير قال: قيل لأبي عبدالله عليه السلام وأنا عنده: إن سالم بن أبي حفصة يروي عنك أنك تتكلم على سبعين وجهًا لك من كلها المخرج، قال: فقال: ما يريد سالم مني؟ أيريد أن أجيئ بالملائكة؟! فوالله ما جاء بها النبيون، ولقد قال إبراهيم: إني سقيم والله ما كان سقيمًا وما كذب، ولقد قال إبراهيم: بَلْ فَعَلَهُ كَبِيرُهُمْ هَذَا وما فعله وما كذب، ولقد قال يوسف: إِنَّمَا لَسَارِقُونَ والله ما كانوا سارقين وما كذب

[1/73] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Ibn Masud – Ali b. al-Hasan – al-Abbas b. A'mir and Ja'far b. Muhammad b. Hukaym – Aban b. Uthman – Abi Basir who said: It was said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام - while I was with him: Salim b. Abi Hafsa narrates from you that you speak [any statement] with seventy facets [alternative possible interpretations] - for each facet you have a way out [a way of couching words by which the truth may still be discovered to escape outright lying]<sup>1</sup>, so he said: «What does Salim want from me? Does he want me to come with the angels [to prove my authority]?! For by Allah - not even the prophets came with them, and Ibrahim had said "I am sick" but by Allah he was not sick nor did he lie<sup>2</sup>, and Ibrahim also said: "Rather this biggest one of them [idol] has done it" while he had not done it nor did he lie<sup>3</sup>, and Yusuf said: "You are thieves" and by Allah they were not thieves nor did he lie<sup>4 5</sup>»*

<sup>1</sup> Salim b. Abi Hafsa (d. 137) was a leader of the Batri Zaydis who accused the Imam of obfuscating the truth. It should be noted that the Imam had indeed said what is attributed to him here by Salim, for the Imam does not repudiate it, further, we have a number of corroborating narrations where the Imam is quoted saying the same. There are a number of reasons why the 'Aimma needed to equivocate or maintain what might be termed 'constructive ambiguity' by employing words with multiple meanings. This use of indirect speech is permitted in the Shariah and not considered a lie if it is employed as a way to avoid harm (Taqiyya), and to fulfill a greater good such as to bring about resolution of conflicts between the people or to show people the error of their ways by conjuring up a hypothetical etc. The Imam demonstrates this in examples from the lives of the prophets.

<sup>2</sup> Qur'an 37:88. Ibrahim had said "I am Sick" and he did not lie because they took it to mean that he is literally ill and cannot join them in their festival, while Ibrahim meant that he was sick in heart of witnessing their Shirk, and he made this Tawriyya to get them to leave so that he could get a chance to destroy their idols

<sup>3</sup> Qur'an 21:63. Ibrahim also said "rather this biggest one of them has done it" and this was not a lie, that is because Ibrahim said it to shock them to think anew, he spoke this while predicating it on the condition that he [the idol] could speak and that is why he continued to say "if they should speak", as if wanting to say - if the idol can speak then it can also do the breaking, and this was a way to rebuke them as part of argumentation

<sup>4</sup> Qur'an 12:70. Yusuf did not sin in commanding that because he wished to reconcile between himself and his brothers and that is permitted. Another possible meaning is that they were indeed thieves in the metaphorical sense i.e. they had stolen him in his childhood from his father

<sup>5</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 234 No. 425

[٢/٧٤] الكافي: علي بن ابراهيم، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي نجران، عن عاصم بن حميد، عن منصور بن حازم قال: قلت لأبي عبد الله عليه السلام: ما بالي أسألك عن المسألة فتجيبني فيها بالجواب ثم يجيبك غيري فتجيبه فيها بجواب آخر؟ فقال: إنا نجيب الناس على الزيادة والنقصان قال: قلت: فأخبرني عن أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله صدقوا على محمد صلى الله عليه وآله أم كذبوا؟ قال: بل صدقوا قلت: فما بالهم اختلفوا فقال: أما تعلم أن الرجل كان يأتي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله فيسأله عن المسألة فيجيبه فيها بالجواب، ثم يجيبه بعد ذلك بما ينسخ ذلك الجواب فنسخت الأحاديث بعضها بعضها

[2/74] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father – Ibn Abi Najran – A’sim b. Humayd – Mansur b. Hazim who said: I said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: What is my condition - I ask you a question about something and you answer me in it with a certain answer, then someone other than me comes to you so you answer him in it with a different answer? He said: «We answer the people with addition (in-depth) and with deletion (in-brief)<sup>1</sup>» I said: Inform me about the companions of the Messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله - were they truthful about Muhammad صلى الله عليه وآله or did they lie? He said: «They were truthful<sup>2</sup>» I said: So what was the matter with them that they differed? He said: «Don’t you know that a man used to come to the Messenger of Allah صلى الله عليه وآله and ask him about a thing so he answers him in it with an answer, then he answers him after that with that which abrogates the former answer, so the narrations abrogated one another<sup>3 4</sup>»*

[٣/٧٥] الكافي: أحمد بن إدريس، عن محمد بن عبد الجبار، عن الحسن بن علي، عن ثعلبة بن ميمون، عن زرارة بن أعين، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: سألته عن مسألة فأجابني ثم جاء رجل فسأله عنها فأجابه بخلاف ما أجابني، ثم جاء رجل آخر فأجابه بخلاف ما أجابني وأجاب صاحبي، فلما خرج الرجلان قلت: يا ابن رسول الله رجلان من أهل العراق من شيعتكم قدما يسألان فأجبت كل واحد منهما بغير ما أجبت به صاحبه؟ فقال: يا زرارة! إن هذا خير لنا وأبقى لنا ولكن ولو اجتمعتم على أمر واحد لصدقتم الناس علينا وكان أقل لبقائنا وبقائكم قال: ثم قلت لابي عبد الله عليه السلام: شيعتكم لو حملتموه على الاسنة أو على النار لمضوا وهم يخرجون من عندكم مختلفين، قال: فأجابني بمثل جواب أبيه

<sup>1</sup> It is known that any jurisprudential question has many variables which can change the answer given at any moment. The Imam may answer someone in a specific way leaving out the general ruling, or he may answer in an absolute manner without going over the different conditions that affect the ruling. When the Imam answers someone in depth it means that he goes through all the different scenarios and expands on them. Sometimes the Imam answers someone keeping only one aspect in mind [because of his knowledge of what the questioner requires] and thus the answer is brief. This does not bring about a contradiction

<sup>2</sup> This does not mean that they were all truthful all the time but as a whole, since there was a group [of companions] within the whole group of companions who were truthful

<sup>3</sup> It is unfortunate that most people have heard of verses abrogating one another but are not aware of the possibility of the same occurring in the Sunna, where the prophet could have disallowed something at first, because of some historical circumstances, which when they disappear cause him to allow that thing later on, this explains the existence of Ahadith that seemingly contradict each other, but can be resolved with this in mind

<sup>4</sup> al-Kafi: 1/65



[3/75] al-Kafi: *Ahmad b. Idris – Muhammad b. Abd al-Jabbar – al-Hasan b. Ali – Tha'labā b. Maymun – Zurara b. A'yan – Abi Ja'far* عليه السلام. He [Zurara] said: I asked him about a matter so he answered me, then a man came to him and asked him about it so he answered him with a different answer to mine, then another man came so he answered him with a different answer to the one he gave me and the first man, so when the two men had exited I said: O the son of the Messenger of Allah - two men from the people of Iraq from among your followers came to ask you - but you answered each one of them with a different answer? He said: «O Zurara, this is better and more safe for us and you, for if you were all to unite upon one position the people would believe you [in what you say] about us and that would be a threat to both our and your survival<sup>1</sup>» He (Zurara) said: Then I [later] said to Abi Abdillah عليه السلام: Your followers - if you were to make them move in the face of arrows or on fire they would do it but they come out from you having differences! He [Zurara] said: So he [the Imam] answered me with the same reply as his father<sup>2</sup>

[٤/٧٦] علل الشرائع: أبيه، عن سعد، عن محمد بن الوليد والسندي، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن محمد بن بشير وحرير، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: قلت له: إنه ليس شيء أشد علي من اختلاف أصحابنا، قال: ذلك من قبلي

[4/76] Ilal al-Sharai: *His father – Sa'd – Muhammad b. al-Walid and al-Sindi – Aban b. Uthman – Muhammad b. Bashir and Hariz – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام. He (Hariz) said: I said to him: There is nothing more difficult for me [to bear] than the differences [that exists] between our fellows, he [the Imam] said: «That is from me [I purposely caused that]»<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> The Imam was concerned that if the Shia became one homogeneous body within the wider society - narrating and practicing identical rites on the authority of the 'Aimma - it will cause them to stand out, making it easier to be recognized. Furthermore, the claim to have an association with the 'Aimma would become believable because of this unanimity, opening the door to persecution by their haters. However, if the Shia were to diverge in what they attribute to the 'Aimma and differ among themselves, the opponents will not be able to recognize whether a certain group is Shia or not. This divergence will even cause the opponents doubt the existence of an association in the first place. The success of this policy of the 'Aimma was such that the proto-Sunni's historically doubted whether there was any link between the 'Aimma and their putative followers and many considered the whole thing to be a fabrication

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/65; It has also been narrated by al-Saduq with the same upper chain and in it has come - 'لو اجتمعتم على أمر واحد لتصدكم الناس' - 'if you were to unite upon one position - the people would target you' and this is more natural in light of the context [See: and Ilal al-Shara`i: 2/395]

<sup>3</sup> Ilal al-Shara`i: 2/395. The importance of this particular narration and the one above it cannot be overestimated. They indicate that the Imam would purposely create differences among his followers by giving divergent answers to the same question. This is one of the main reasons why we have contradicting narrations in our corpus. The justification for this is Taqiyya [to preserve the lives of the believers from the unjust aggressors]. As the Imam is said to have commented when asked about Ikhtilaf - 'لو اجتمعتم على أمر واحد لاخذ برقابكم' - 'if you had been united on a single position - it would have been off with your necks'

[٥/٧٧] الكافي: علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن عثمان بن عيسى والحسن بن محبوب جميعا، عن ساعة، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: سألته عن رجل اختلف عليه رجلان من أهل دينه في أمر كلاهما يرويه، أحدهما يأمر بأخذه والآخر ينهاه عنه، كيف يصنع؟ فقال: يرجئه حتى يلقي من يخبره، فهو في سعة حتى يلقاه

وفي رواية اخرى: بأبيها أخذت من باب التسليم وسعك

[5/77] al-Kafi: *Ali b. Ibrahim – his father – Uthman b. Isa and al-Hasan b. Mahbub all together – Sama'a – Abi Abdillah* عليه السلام. He [Sama'a] said: I asked him about a man who is answered oppositely by two of his co-religionists [Shi'as] in regards to a matter - both transmitting it [their answers - on your authority], one of them obligates it while the other forbids it - what should he do? He said: «He [the man] withholds [doing anything] until he accesses one who will inform him [of the true position], and he is respited until such a time as he meets him»

And in another transmission [the Imam said]: «Whichever of them you act by - suffices you - if done in subservience [with the intention of obeying]»<sup>1</sup>

## الباب السادس عشر: حسن الجواب مناسبا لفهم السائل والمخاطب

### Chapter 16: Fitting Response Relative to the Understanding of the Questioner

[١/٧٨] رجال الكشي: حمدويه، عن البيهقي، عن يونس قال: قال العبد الصالح عليه السلام: يا يونس ارفق بهم، فإن كلامك يدق عليهم قال: قلت: إني يقولون لي: زنديق، قال لي: ما يضرك أن تكون في يدك لؤلؤة فيقول لك الناس: هي حصاة، وما كان ينفعك إذا كان في يدك حصاة فيقول الناس: هي لؤلؤة

[1/78] Rijal al-Kashshi: *Hamduwayh – al-Yaqtini – Yunus who said: The Righteous Servant* عليه السلام said: «O Yunus - be more lenient towards them for your words are hard-hitting on them»<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/65. If someone receives conflicting reports - both attributed to the Imam - one obligating action and the other forbidding it - the Imam advises postponing judgment until you can meet him who will resolve it. This is obviously dependent on the possibility of the Mukallaf to refer the matter back to the Imam or a Mufti who is a Marja of Taqlid, so he will postpone acting until he meets him, and the words of the two men [who report the Imams position] will have no Hujjiyyah because they are contradicting, and in this age there is no great difficulty upon the Mukallaf [to access the Marja]. This is Tawaqquf. The seeker is also not blamable in the interim. al-Kulayni includes a variant transmission which says - he can choose to do either one and no fault will attach itself to him if this is done with the intention of obeying. This is Takhyir

<sup>2</sup> Yunus b. Abd al-Rahman was a trained theologian who used to engage in scholastic disputations in defense of the doctrines of the faith. This was perceived negatively by many of the “traditionalist” Shia narrators who disparaged what they considered to be his “independent thinking”

I [Yunus] said: But they consider me a Zindiq [heretic]! He [the Imam] said to me: «What will it affect you if you have in your hand a pearl but the people say to you: It is a stone! And what will it benefit you if you have in your hand a stone but the people say: It is a pearl!»<sup>1</sup>

[٢/٧٩] الخصال: في الحديث الأربعائة: قال أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام: خالطوا الناس بما يعرفون ودعوهم مما ينكرون، ولا تحملوهم على أنفسكم وعلينا، إن أمرنا صعب مستصعب لا يحتمله إلا ملك مقرب أو نبي مرسل أو عبد قد امتحن الله قلبه للإيمان

[2/79] al-Khisal: In the 'Four Hundred' Narration: *The Commander of the Faithful* عليه السلام *said*: «Interact with the people with that which they know and leave them be as to that which they do not know, and do not impose [empower] them upon yourselves and us. Our affair is hard [in of itself] and deemed hard [by others] - no one can bear it except an angel brought-near or a prophet sent or a slave whose heart has been tried for faith by Allah»<sup>2</sup>

علل الشرائع: أبيه، عن سعد، عن البرقي، عن ابن بزيع، عن ابن بشير، عن أبي حصين، عن أبي بصير، عن أحدهما عليها السلام قال: لا تكذبوا بحديث أتاكم به مرجيء و لا قدرى و لا خارجي و لا خارجي نسبه إلينا، فإنكم لا تدرون لعله شيء من الحق فتكذبوا الله عز و جل فوق عرشه

[3/80] Ilal al-Sharai: *His father – Sa'd – al-Barqi – Ibn Bazi' – Ibn Bashir – Abi Husayn – Abi Basir – One of them* عليها السلام *who said*: «Do not reject a narration which is brought to you by a Murji<sup>3</sup> or a Qadari<sup>4</sup> or a Khariji<sup>5</sup> which he attributes to us, for you do not know - perhaps it is something of the truth and you will be rejecting Allah Mighty and Majestic above his throne»<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Rijal al-Kashshi: 488 No. 928

<sup>2</sup> al-Khisal: 2/624. The affair (Wilaya) of the 'Aimma and their words are hard for many people to accept. The hardship spoken about is not necessarily a difficulty in understanding, but of a reticence to submit and accept what they say and acknowledge their superiority. The Imam advises the Shia to mingle with the Mukhalifin and speak to them those things which are common between both, but not to confront them with that which they consider alien, because it will cause a revulsion in them "the people hate that which they do not know". This act of abandoning Taqiyya by divulging the secrets to them will also empower them against us, because they will use it to denounce and further persecute

<sup>3</sup> The Murjia are an early grouping which held the opinion that judgement should be left to Allah as per someones Iman. Even someone who commits a major sin remains a believer, because faith is independent of deeds and requires but acknowledgment of the Shahada

<sup>4</sup> The Khawarij held the opposite position whereby they excommunicated anyone they felt was not living up to the high standards they expected a Muslim to demonstrate

<sup>5</sup> The Qadariyya believed in absolute free-will, a reaction against the Jabriyya (pre-destinarians). They held that God had no role in human actions whatsoever

<sup>6</sup> Ilal al-Shara'i: 2/395. The narration concerns someone who is in doubt whether a Hadith is true or false, but if one is certain of a Hadith's falsity then it is permitted for him to reject it, and there is no doubt that people lied and fabricated things and attributed them to the prophet and the 'Aimma. If a narration is not established to be originating from them then it is not permitted to depend upon it but one should avoid calling it a lie

## الباب السابع عشر: عدم معذورية الجاهل المقصر

### Chapter 17: No Excuse for the Ignorant One who Falls Short

[١/-] امالي الطوسي: المفيد، عن ابن قولويه، عن محمد الحميري، عن ابيه، عن هارون، عن ابن زياد قال: سمعت جعفر بن محمد عليها السلام وقد سئل عن قوله تعالى قُلْ فَلِلَّهِ الْحُجَّةُ الْبَالِغَةُ فقال: ان الله تعالى يقول للعبد يوم القيامة: عبدى أكنت عالما؟ فان قال: نعم قال له: أفلا علمت بما علمت؟ وان قال: كنت جاهلا قال: أفلا تعلمت حتى تعمل؟ فيخصمه فتلك الحجة البالغة

[1/-] Amali of al-Tusi: *al-Mufid – Ibn Qulawayh – Muhammad al-Himyari – his father – Harun – Ibn Ziyad who said*: I heard Ja'far b. Muhammad عليها السلام - and he was asked about His words the Exalted: “to Allah belongs the conclusive argument!”<sup>1</sup> - say: «Allah the Exalted will say to a slave on the day of judgment: My slave did you possess knowledge? So if he says: Yes, He will say to him: Why did you not act by what you knew? And if he says: I was ignorant, He will say to him: Why did you not seek knowledge so you could act? Thus he will be vanquished - and that is the “conclusive argument”»<sup>2</sup>

## الباب الثامن عشر: الحديث المخالف للقرآن

### Chapter 18: Narration that Contradicts the Qur'an

[١/٨١] الكافي: محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن هشام بن الحكم وغيره، عن أبي عبد الله عليه السلام قال: خطب النبي صلى الله عليه وآله بمنى فقال: أيها الناس ما جاءكم عني يوافق كتاب الله فأنا قلته وما جاءكم يخالف كتاب الله فلم أقله

[1/81] al-Kafi: *Muhammad b. Ismail – al-Fadhil b. Shadhan – Ibn Abi Umayr – Hisham b. al-Hakam and other than him – Abi Abdillah عليه السلام who said*: «The Prophet صلى الله عليه وآله addressed the people in Mina and said: O people, whatever comes to you attributed to me which

<sup>1</sup> Qur'an 6:149

<sup>2</sup> Bihar al-Anwar: 2/29. al-Muhsini does not consider the Amali of al-Tusi to have reached the latter-day scholars like al-Majlisi with a proper chain of transmission, despite this he had at first decided to include this report because of a Qarina [indicator] which is the fact that the Shaykh Abi al-Hasan Sulayman b. al-Hasan al-Sahrishi, who was one of the famous students of the Shaykh al-Ta'ifa al-Tusi and praised by Shaykh Muntajab al-Diin in his Fihrist, quoted this narration in his book 'Qabs al-Misbah fi al-Dua', however, he later ruled it not to be reliable because of the suspicion of a disconnection in its chain i.e. Harun b. Muslim could not have narrated from the companions of al-Sadiq directly, so an intermediary or two must have been dropped and are missing. [Ittisal of the chain would require Harun b. Muslim to have lived a very long life - approx. a hundred and thirty years in age, which would seem to indicate that the narration is Mursal]

agrees with the Book of Allah then I have indeed said it, and whatever comes to you opposing the book of Allah then I never said it»<sup>1</sup>

[٢/٨٢] الكافي: عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن أبيه، عن النضر بن سويد، عن يحيى الحلبي، عن أيوب بن الحر قال: سمعت أبا عبدالله عليه السلام يقول: كل شيء مردود إلى الكتاب والسنة، وكل حديث لا يوافق كتاب الله فهو زخرف

[2/82] al-Kafi: *A number of our companions – Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Khalid – his father – al-Nadhr b. Suwayd – Yahya al-Halabi – Ayyub b. al-Hur who said: I heard Aba Abdillah عليه السلام saying: «Everything is referred back to the Book and the Sunna, and every Hadith that does not agree with the Book of Allah then it is a worthless embellishment»*<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> al-Kafi: 1/69

<sup>2</sup> al-Kafi: 1/69. There are a lot of narrations which do not have a one-to-one correspondance with something in the Qur'an, mainly because their purport cannot be found in the Qur'an [the Qur'an is silent - neither affirming nor rejecting]. Is the absence of direct contradiction equal to 'agreement' that the two reports in this chapter speak of? That would be a far-fetched interpretation. A solution is to measure the degree of agreement between a narration vis a vis the Qur'an relative to the spirit of the Qur'an, the framework it provides and overall objectives it sets forth instead of confining ourselves to scrutinizing the Qur'an's wordings. Hence, what the Imam wishes to say in this statement of his is that - an authentic narration should not be inconsistent with the Qur'anic world-view and the broad vision conveyed by the prophet and the Awsiya. Practically speaking, an experienced and sincere scholar who delves into their words over a long period of time can get a 'feel' for whether a narration falls in line or not and this would be one of the conditions for the Hujjiyya of a narration

## Bibliography

al-Kashshī. Ikhtiyār Ma`arifah al-Rijāl (Rijal al-Kashshi). Ed. Dr. Ḥasan al-Muṣṭafawī. Mashhad: Mu'assasah al-Nashr fi Jāmi`ah, 1390

al-Kulaynī. al-Kāfī. Ed. `Alī Akbar al-Ghaffārī. 3rd. 8 vols. Tehran: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyyah, 1388.

al-Majlisī. Bihār al-Anwār. 4th. 110 vols. Tehran: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyyah, 1362

al-Ṣadūq. `Ilal al-Sharā`i`. Ed. Muhammad Sadiq Bahr al-`Ulum. 1 vols. Najaf: Maktabah al-Haydariyya, 1385

al-Ṣadūq. al-Amālī. 4th. 1 vols. Qum: Maktabah al-Islamiyyah, 1404

al-Ṣadūq. al-Khiṣāl. 2nd. 1 vols. Qum: Mu'assasah al-Nashr al-Islami, 1403

al-Ṣadūq. al-Tawhid. Ed. Sayyid Hashim al-Husayni al-Tihrani. Qum: Mu'assasah al-Nashr al-Islami, 1398

al-Ṣadūq. Ma`ānī al-Akhhbār. Ed. `Alī Akbar al-Ghaffārī. Qum: Mu'assasah al-Nashr al-Islāmī, 1379

al-Ṣadūq. Uyun Akhbar al-Ridha. 2 vols. Qum: Intisharat al-Sharif al-Radhi, 1378